

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting Minutes
January 23, 2025

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Bruce Yow
3. Catherine Callahan (2nd Vice-Chair) - ABSENT
4. Christine Arseneault (Chair)
5. Clarence R. Fischer
6. Danny Kodmur
7. Daveed Mandell
8. Emily Witkin
9. Herb Hastings
10. Hillary Brown
11. Janice Armigo Brown
12. Roland Wong
13. Sam Buman
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of seven (7) in-person BATF members. Two members participated remotely: Daveed Mandell used his first “Just Cause,” and Roland Wong used his first “Just Cause.”

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Bob Franklin
Ryan Greene-Roesel

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

David Coggshall (BART staff)
Hayley Toy (BART staff)

Mayra Perez (Captioner)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Sara Desumala (Guest)
Joshua Saunders (Guest)
Shana Ray (Guest)
Aleta Dupre (Guest)
Alicia Jackson (Guest)
Katherine Kzeft (Guest)
Nora Lewis (Guest)
Troy Russell (Guest)
Vi Ibarra (Guest)
Nicola Fraser (Guest)
Tyler Sha (Guest)
Janien Harrison (Guest)
Shawn Costello (Guest)
Jeremy Dunbar (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Aleta Dupre introduced herself. She believed everyone, whether you have a disability or not, should engage respectfully with the BATF. She asked to make sure the escalators are working within the BART system.

Jerry Grace said, “Happy New Year,” and hopes that everyone has a good 2025. Additionally, he felt bad about the number of fires that were occurring in Southern California.

Shawn Costello thanked the BART staff for fixing the elevator at the San Leandro BART Station. He mentioned he has not been receiving monthly BATF agendas and he requested that they be emailed to him again.

Joshua Saunders mentioned that he had used the new faregates at Hayward BART Station earlier. He mentioned he tapped his Clipper Card on his smartphone and added that he has limited vision. He stated that he can see the faregates open and pass through them, but he was worried that riders who are blind may not be able to detect when they are supposed to go through the faregate.

3. Approval of November 21, 2024 meeting minutes

Christine Arseneault rescheduled the approval of the November 21, 2024 minutes until February so that amendments could be incorporated.

4. New committee member nomination

- **Joshua Saunders**

Joshua Saunders introduced himself and expressed why he is interested in joining the BATF.

Sam Buman moved to recommend Joshua Saunders as a BATF member. Hillary Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with ten (10) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

5. New faregate sounds

Bob Franklin shared three different sounds that faregates currently make when using a Clipper Card:

- One (1) beep means it is a successful entry
- Two (2) beeps mean it is a successful exit
- Three (3) beeps mean there is an error

Bob Franklin mentioned BART is working on ways to generate sounds that make more sense to understand. He shared this is an introduction to this project and this will be shared over several BATF meetings to receive feedback.

Herb Hasting volunteered himself to be involved with the new proposed faregate sounds. He mentioned you could hear when the gates open and close at the accessibility older faregates and asked whether you can hear the new faregates open and close. Herb Hastings recommended louder cues for noisy environments like freeways, adjacent to elevators. Bob Franklin stated that the new faregates are much quieter. Bob Franklin added the beeps from the old faregates are the same on the new faregates now, but the new faregates have the ability to produce any sound.

Janice Armigo-Brown first asked about the beeps from the faregates because some may have hearing impairments or some may be deaf. Her second comment was that she witnessed fare evasion while heading to the BATF meeting and suggested that there should be a sound that alerts fare evaders.

Bruce Yow asked to confirm that the three (3) beeps will also be produced on the next generation faregate system and Bob Franklin confirmed that the new gates will use the same sounds.

Sam Buman mentioned the 12th St. BART Station by the elevators, the beep sounds are not beeping and added people who are blind or visually impaired will not know when exiting from the platform elevator to the new faregate.

Jeremy Dunbar mentioned that the stations that do not have the new faregates have people jumping over the faregates and asked if there is an alert to BART personnel that someone is fare evading. Bob Franklin mentioned BART personnel do not have the capability to detect fare evasions with the older faregates, but the new faregates technology will have the ability to alert BART employees that someone is fare evading.

Daveed Mandell mentioned when he goes through the faregates that it is hard to hear the beeps because the surrounding area may be loud. He was also concerned about people pushing through the faregates when the riders cannot hear the beeping noise. Daveed Mandell added when he wears his backpack and uses his cane, the faregates can close too early and does not feel secure. He also mentioned looking into finding better ways to locate the accessible faregate for entering and exiting maybe with different textiles in front of the accessible faregate or audio of the location of the accessible faregate.

Shawn Costello noticed the new faregates located at the accessible faregate should be more visible and mentioned the faregates do not stay open long enough.

Shana Ray mentioned that the beeps from the new faregates sometimes are hard to hear. She mentioned 12th St., Hayward, and Civic Center/UN Plaza BART Station do not make any sounds.

Aleta Dupre asked whether there have been any surveys to determine what beeps to use at the new faregates. Bob Franklin stated with the new proposed faregates beeps, BART will provide beeping samples and hire sound experts to determine what works best.

Herb Hastings mentioned that even if there are no beeping noise from the new faregates, the arrow will indicate when you can enter or exit the new faregates.

Sam Buman suggested better signage for future projects to avoid confusion.

6. Member announcements

Clarence Fischer asked to take into consideration the elevator sound levels at each BART station to determine whether the sound has to be adapted to the location, such as a subway station, an indoor or outdoor station, a station close to a freeway stop,

etc. He suggested to consider station environments (subway, outdoor, etc.) when setting sound levels of the elevator.

Sam Buman shared when he was at 12th St. BART Station and the elevator was completely blocked off once arriving from the platform due to the installation of new faregates. He stated there were no signs whatsoever of where to go to access another elevator. Sam Buman asked a BART Station Agent, who told him to take the elevator down to the concourse and head to the other side to take the elevator going the opposite direction. He opted to take the City Center stairs instead.

7. Staff announcements

Elena Van Loo shared a few announcements:

1. BATF meetings will be back at East Bay Paratransit for the next meeting, which is located at 1750 Broadway, 1st Floor Conference Room, Oakland, CA 94612
2. Travel reimbursements went up to \$16.70 effective January 1, 2025, from \$15.85.
3. Annie Koruga has been terminated as an appointed BATF member and there will be an agenda item to nominate and elect a Vice-Chair at the next BATF meeting.

8. Chairperson announcements

Christine Arseneault mentioned agenda item eight (8) was postponed due to time constraints.

9. Future agenda items – member suggest topics

- 2025 Goals - Members were asked to reflect on their 2025 goals for enhancing the committee's impact and improving the user experience, and to share these goals at the next meeting for discussion.
- Faregate Sound - Due to the overwhelming comments on the Faregate sound, a subcommittee was proposed to address feedback on the new faregates and noise concerns, with volunteers encouraged to email Bob their contact information to assist in sound selection.

10. Adjournment

Herb Hasting moved to adjourned January 23, 2025, meeting and Clarence R. Fischer second the motion. The meeting adjourned at 3:00 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, February 27, 2025.