

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**  
Committee Meeting Minutes  
March 27, 2025

**1. Roll Call of Members:**

1. Anita Ortega
2. Bruce Yow
3. Catherine Callahan (2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair)
4. Christine Arseneault (Chair)
5. Clarence R. Fischer
6. Danny Kodmur
7. Daveed Mandell
8. Emily Witkin - ABSENT
9. Herb Hastings
10. Hillary Brown
11. Janice Armigo Brown – ABSENT
12. Joshua Saunders
13. Roland Wong –ABSENT
14. Sam Buman
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of eleven (11) in-person BATF members. No, “Just Cause,” used.

**BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:**

Elena Van Loo  
Bob Franklin  
Ryan Greene-Roesel  
Kevin McDonald

**BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:**

Director Robert Raburn  
Byron Toma (BART staff)  
Michael Gerbracht (BART staff)

Ahmad Rassai (BART staff)  
Mayra Perez (Captioner)  
Sarah (Captioner)  
Shana Ray (Guest)  
Janien Harrison (Guest)  
Sara Desumala (Guest)  
Troy Russell (Guest)  
Vi Ibarra (Guest)  
Valerie Buell (Guest)  
David Coggshall (Guest)  
Tanya Washington (Guest)

## **2. Public Comments**

Sara Desumala introduced herself.

Troy Russell introduced himself as a member of The Contra Costa Development Disabilities Council, is a mental health ambassador, and a self-advocate for people with disabilities.

Vi Ibarra introduced herself and works at The Developmental Disabilities Council in Contra Costa County.

Shana Ray shared her Clipper Card App on her smartphone worked when tilting the smartphone towards the faregate to make it easier to go through the faregate. She suggested BART should publicize how to better use your smartphone when entering and exiting the faregates with Clipper Card App.

Aleta Dupree asked how does the BATF reach out to educate people at BART on how to be more, “disability friendly.” She did notice an advertisement for discount cards for seniors and people with disabilities on a BART train. She mentioned that BART needs to promote other programs, such as Clipper Card Start.

## **3. Approval of November 21, 2024 meeting minutes and January 23, 2025 meeting minutes**

Herb Hastings moved approval of the January 23, 2025 meeting minutes with amendments. Joshua Saunders second the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention.

Daveed Mandell moved approval of the February 27, 2025 meeting minutes with amendments. Herb Hastings second the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, one (1) against, and zero (0) abstention.

#### **4. How to run an effective public meeting – Refresher**

Byron Toma, BART's Legal Department presented.

He shared multiple slides, "How to run an effective public meeting", which is part of the BATF 03-27-2025 agenda package:

- The big picture
- Alice Sturgis Philosophy
- Key Principles
- Summary of steps in handling a motion
- Precedence of motions
- What are privileged motions?
- What are the privileged motions?
- What are subsidiary motions?
- What are the subsidiary motions?
- Ranking of privileged and subsidiary motions
- Tips regarding the ranking table
- What is a main motion?
- What is a restorative main motion?
- What is an incidental motion?
- Unanimous (general) consent
- NOTE: Parliamentary procedure rules co-exist with other enactments of government-Hierarchy of governing documents under Sturgis (p.203)
- Did you know?
- Words of wisdom regarding meetings
- Words of wisdom regarding public comments and announcements
- Final words of wisdom
- Resources

Danny Kodmur asked if there is a specific definition of what are the expectations and limitations of a subsidiary body or advisory body as opposed to the decision-making body and added BATF is classified as an advisory body and not to make decisions. Byron Toma mentioned under law there is really no difference between subsidiary bodies or advisory bodies, which are governed by the Brown Act. He mentioned the BATF is an advisory because it advises a governing body.

Janien Harrison noted “Don’t bogged down with the details,” and mentioned this seems to contradict presentations which contain detailed information. Byron Toma commented that Alice Sturgis was urging people to focus on the “big picture,” and to think about what you are really there for to move forward the public’s business and to put aside fighting over details.

Janien Harrison was curious about the specifics of making a motion. She wondered how crucial this was and said she might forget how to say a motion correctly. Byron Toma said that Chair and/or staff will help and not worry too much about how to say a motion correctly.

Clarence R. Fischer asked if BATF is an advisory committee to the BART Board of Directors. Byron Toma confirmed the BATF Advisory Committee is an advisory committee under BART Board of Directors. Clarence R. Fischer added anything that has been approved by the appointed BATF members goes to the BART Board of Directors.

Clarence R. Fischer noted that he is also a private citizen and wishes at times to address disability and senior citizen related issues to the BART Board of Directors before addressing the BATF members. Byron Toma stated all public meetings are subject to the 1<sup>st</sup> Amendment right to express your opinions and shared that you can go to the BART Board of Directors to let them know you are here as an individual and not representing BATF Advisory Committee.

Shana Ray asked what is the difference between the Brown Act versus the Alice Sturgis Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure. Byron Toma noted that Brown Act’s rules are very detailed and have many exceptions to the general rules for proceeding. Alice Sturgis is more of an easier common-sense guide than the Brown Act.

Aleta Dupree thought the presentation was good and mentioned she had not heard anything about the public’s rights and responsibilities. She expressed there are situations where the presiding officer will give one person more time than another. Aleta Dupree thought the Board of Directors was governed by Robert’s Rule of Order and she mentioned she liked Alice Sturgis better. She ended by stating that BART needs to do better job to make sure the public is heard. Bryon Toma mentioned that everybody has a right to engage under “public comment,” no matter how long it takes.

Herb Hastings spoke on consent calendar agenda items where a number of agenda items can be voted under one vote with a 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> motion.

Christine Arseneault thanked Byron Toma for presenting.

## **5. New fare gates and station hardening update**

Michael Gerbracht presented the agenda item.

Project update:

- Conceptional design started in 2018
- BART started districtwide installation in July 2024
- As of March 14, 2025, BART has installed 303 of 630 gates districtwide
- Projected to complete districtwide replacement by the end of 2025

BART stations completed (completed 23 stations):

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| 1. West Oakland                                 | 12. Warm Springs/South Fremont               |
| 2. Fruitvale                                    | 13. Montgomery St.                           |
| 3. Civic Center/UN Plaza                        | 14. Dublin/Pleasanton                        |
| 4. Richmond                                     | 15. Hayward                                  |
| 5. 24 <sup>th</sup> St. Mission                 | 16. South Hayward                            |
| 6. Oakland Airport Connector                    | 17. 12 <sup>th</sup> St./Oakland City Center |
| 7. Antioch                                      | 18. Embarcadero                              |
| 8. 16 <sup>th</sup> St. Mission                 | 19. Orinda                                   |
| 9. San Francisco International<br>Airport (SFO) | 20. Downtown Berkeley                        |
| 10. Coliseum                                    | 21. Rockridge                                |
| 11. Powell St.                                  | 22. Lafayette                                |
|   | 23. Pittsburg Center                         |

Deployment schedule (as of March 14, 2025)

Elevator Accessible Fare Gates (AFG) planned to be installed between by April at the following stations:

- |                 |                     |
|-----------------|---------------------|
| 1. Montgomery   | 6. Concord          |
| 2. Powell       | 7. North Berkeley   |
| 3. Balboa       | 8. El Cerrito Plaza |
| 4. Rockridge    | 9. Bay Fair         |
| 5. Walnut Creek |                     |

Station hardening:

- Service Gates, Emergency Exits, and Station Barriers are being raised to deter Fare Evasion while maintaining accessibility
- Temporary barrier modifications are installed at each station after the new fare gates.

- Additional modifications are being piloted to address fare evasion while maintaining accessibility.

Herb Hastings suggested installing an alarm to deter fare evasions when a rider tries to push through the faregates. He suggested putting tactiles leading to the accessible faregates for BART stations. Michael Gerbracht mentioned in regard to noise, sounds, and alarms that BART is looking into some additional modifications to the sounds of the faregates. He mentioned the tactiles that have already been installed will still lead to the accessible faregates.

Daveed Mandell has made a few suggestions with regards to the new faregates and he felt they have been ignored, such as providing directional sounds so riders know where faregate arrays are located.

Hillary Brown mentioned they are visually impaired and noticed the new faregates itself do not have stickers or markings to let them know there is a faregate. They stated that the new faregates are just a clear panel.

Shana Ray wanted to echo Daveed Mandell's concerns about the faregates and that they should operate in different directions (not bi-directionally) and the importance of finding the faregates.

Sara Desumala suggested having the faregates talk instead of the beeping sounds.

Clarence R. Fischer asked why the new faregates are installed down-the-line instead of installing them randomly. Michael Gerbracht stated that there are considerations when installing the new faregates and noted each station have different funding sources and address different needs within the nine (9) different BART districts.

Sam Buman stated he is happy to see the new faregates.

Joshua Saunders asked when the tests for the new faregate occurred. Michael Gerbracht confirmed that the first new faregates were installed at the West Oakland BART Station back in December 2023.

Aleta Dupree shared she has to watch the space behind her to avoid piggyback riders.

Valerie Buell was happy to see the new faregates at the 12<sup>th</sup> St. BART Station. She said that they looked great, but it was not long before witnessing aggressive piggybacking. She mentioned the accessible faregate was broken and the gates did not completely close.

Director Robert Raburn said that he is sympathetic about what he has been hearing and he, too, has experienced piggyback riders.

Director Robert Raburn confirmed the new faregates are bi-directional. He shared new software update will be done in the future.

## **6. New committee member nomination – Shana Ray**

Shana Ray introduced herself and expressed why she is interested in joining the BATF.

Daveed Mandell moved to recommend Shana Ray as a BATF member. Herb Hastings seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstention

## **7. Member announcements**

Daveed Mandell announced a multi-year pilot program at select Metro stations. The London-headquartered accessibility tech company Waymap will now see its AI-driven navigation tool used across the entire Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority's (WMATA) network. He urged BART and San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) test this new wayfinding.

Sam Buman asked why there is not an agenda item for the nomination and election of the vice chair. Ryan Greene-Roesel stated she will address his question under "staff announcements."

Danny Kodmur shared that a local television station premiered, "Change, Not Charity: The American with Disabilities Act," documentary about the ADA history. The documentary is also available on YouTube.

Clarence Fischer asked about Ethics AB1234 training. Elena Van Loo mentioned she will reach out to those who needs to take Ethics Training via email.

## **8. Staff announcements**

Kevin McDonald introduced himself as the new Manager of Access Programs in the Customer Access and Accessibility Department and will be working on everything related to accessibility within the BART.

Bob Franklin reminded BATF Advisory Committee members, like all BART's advisory committee members, are subject to [Code of Conduct](#) and need to keep meetings positive. Any disruptive behavior, such as slurs or derogatory comments, is against the rules and against the BATF By-Laws.

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that Customer Access and Accessibility Department did reach out to legal department to discuss how to proceed with the final outcome for the Vice Chair position. She mentioned there were five votes for Herb Hastings, two votes for Hillary Brown, and five abstentions from the last BATF meeting on 02-27-2025 votes under agenda item "Nominate and elect BATF Vice Chair (and 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice chair, if open.)" Ryan Greene-Roesel confirmed Herb Hastings will be the Vice-Chair, as he received a majority of non-abstention votes cast. Herb Hastings will be the Vice-Chair until September 2025, when Nominations and elections for Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair take place.

Elena Van Loo informed BATF members that the 1st quarter travel reimbursements ends on March 31, 2025 and to let her know before April 10, 2025 if there are any changes to their transit card numbers.

Director Robert Raburn suggested to agendize for a future BATF meeting the potential funding measure and the dilemmas that the BART District is facing in Fiscal Year 27.

## **9. Chairperson announcements**

No chairperson announcements.

## **10. Future agenda items – member suggest topics**

- BART satisfaction survey with focus on accessibility
- Accessibility-related complaints within the BART System report
- BART funding gap and latest financial report
- Training materials for the BART Board of Directors
- Customer assistance on the weekend, when Customer Service is closed
- Waymap Wayfinding app
- WAV (Accessible Vehicle) services in San Francisco
- Detectable Guideways update
- BART's public address announcements, including overlapping audio announcements
- How to make it easier for blind people to find the faregates,
  - Generating additional sounds
  - Better tactile path



## **11. Adjournment**

Clarence R. Fischer-moved to adjourn the March 27, 2025 meeting and Joshua Saunders-second the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:18pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, April 24, 2025.