



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program**

Citizens' Oversight Committee Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, August 23, 2017 4:30 pm

**Conference Room 1700
Kaiser Center Tower, 17th Floor
300 Lakeside Drive, Oakland CA 94612**

Meeting Number	Meeting Date	Meeting Time
Term 6, Meeting 2	August 23, 2017	4:40 pm – 5:22 pm
Attendees	<i>Current Members</i> Clinton J. Loftman Derek Schaible Karen Varnado Ching Wu	<i>Staff</i> Thomas Horton Jose Ramiro Salazar Diann Castleberry
Agenda Item	Action Taken	
<i>Welcome & Introductions</i>	<p>D. Castleberry called the meeting to order at approximately 4:40 pm.</p> <p>D. Castleberry took roll call, noted members in attendance and confirmed there was a quorum.</p> <p>The Committee was informed that M. Mazzini had moved into a new role with her company and that agenda management of the COC would be handled by D. Castleberry.</p> <p>D. Castleberry noted that there was one public speaker on the agenda in attendance.</p>	
<i>Review of Administrative Matters</i>	<p>D. Castleberry reviewed the following administrative matter:</p> <p>The May 17, 2017 meeting minutes were reviewed, approved and accepted with a motion by K. Varnados and second by D. Schaible. The minutes will be posted on the BART website.</p>	
<i>Presentation: Construction Photo Highlights</i>	<p>In response to the Committee's May 17 request, T. Horton walked through photo highlights of the Earthquake Safety Program. Photos illustrated construction activities showing samples of the earthquake safety program retrofit work. Committee Chair D.</p>	



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>Schaible asked a series of clarifying and technical questions that BART representative T. Horton responded to ranging from retrofit work done to operability versus safety as well as a series of questions regarding images viewed.</p> <p>The committee accepted the report.</p>
<i>Project Update</i>	<p>T. Horton provided an overview of the program's progress since the last COC Meeting, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Completed activities: 32 contracts have been completed to date. Since the last meeting, the A-Line North (Lake Merritt to Coliseum) aerial structures retrofit work along the Fremont "A" Line is substantially complete.• Right of Way Acquisition: All acquisitions are complete.• Design: All design work is complete.• Procurement: the Fruitvale and Coliseum Stations contract went out to bid for a third time, following a judge's decision that BART had not adequately informed the BART Board on irregularities that were waived as part of the bid process. In August 2017, the new contract was awarded and is currently in progress.• Construction: Three contracts are currently in construction including Track Procurement for the spur track; Construction at the Oakland Shops, and the Transbay Tube Retrofit. The final two Stations work is in procurement and is about to move into construction.• Transbay tube is in active construction, but will not start affecting revenue service until late 2018. This is when some single tracking work is expected to begin and continue for approximately 4 ½ years.• The last A-Line Station contract, Fruitvale and Coliseum stations, was awarded earlier this month and is expected to be completed in approximately 3 ½ years.• These are the remaining contracts that will close out the Earthquake Safety Program.• Essentially, everything else is done.• D. Schaible asked questions regarding the award of the A Line: Fruitvale and Coliseum Station contract. T. Horton responded and informed the Committee that the award went to the low bidder.• D. Schaible asked if the retrofits for Bay Fair Station were more complicated because it is a transfer station? T. Horton responded that Bay Fair Station retrofits were not



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>particularly more complicated than other stations. He added that Coliseum Station will be significantly more complicated to retrofit due to various elements specific to the station, such as the underground tunnel, the connection to the Oakland Airport Connector system, the Coliseum walkway, and construction coordination and scheduling to accommodate the number of people that travel through the station for events at the Oakland-Alameda County Coliseum.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• D. Schaible asked if the decision to inform the BART Board of irregularities waived during the bid process would affect all BART contracts, and whether BART had considered appealing the decision. T. Horton stated that he understood that the decision would affect all BART contracts and that, so far, there had been no motion to appeal. He further shared that current work activities for the Transbay Tube (TBT) contract consist of procuring materials and preparing work plans. Construction inside the TBT is not expected to begin until mid-2018.• T. Horton explained that the Earthquake Safety Program had received additional funding to exercise all the options for the TBT contract, in addition to the base contract. These funds are not a part of the General Obligation Bond.
<i>Schedule and Financial Report</i>	<p>T. Horton provided an overview of the Program’s schedule and finances, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The completion of the Transbay Tube will mark the completion of the Earthquake Safety Program.• Estimated completion of the final two stations will be about 1 ½ years prior to the tube finishing point. The overall program schedule remains unchanged with anticipated completion in 2022.• This schedule involves opening the system one hour later to get more time on the track. At the last Board meeting, a report was presented on a separate study done regarding maintenance on BART with the consultants recommending an extra hour on the system. Most likely early in the morning because there are fewer riders.• A lengthy discussion ensued regarding the potential of extending blanket maintenance hours.• C. Loftman asked if the study was funded from the General Obligation (GO) funds and T. Horton informed the Committee that the study was not funded with GO funds.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

This was a separate study by BART as part of a *Better BART* maintenance initiative. This change is expected to begin mid to late 2018.

- D. Schaible asked if there will be Title VI work for this ongoing change in service? Attorney Salazar commented that the Better BART Maintenance Study regarding expanded blanket hours is different, however may play into the final analysis. Mr. Salazar further explained who could be affected are those individuals who most use the first trains in the morning who are usually low income or blue-collar workers and riding BART may be their only way to get to work. Mr. Salazar shared that at the public discussion, strong and social comments were made. T. Horton elaborated by sharing that the time to clear power and clear the track, leaves a very small work window.
- C. Loftman asked if this proposal is deleting an hour of service and not time shifting? D. Schaible asked, this is not a total shutdown? T. Horton responded that BART's Maintenance and Engineering (M&E) is proposing additional time for maintenance purposes. The tube will not be in a total shut down. During that window, one option could be to direct a "bus bridge" service for those riders affected. Earthquake Safety work has opened the door to that conversation. Mr. Salazar shared that BART is looking at Title VI consideration as to whether this proposal would be singling out one group with more burden versus the general population. He continued by providing that without having looked at the specific analysis, a proposed expansion of the blanket hours, would allow more maintenance and repair work to make it less likely for things to breakdown as much, such as train equipment, third rail, fans throughout the system, wheel grinding, rail, etc. This maintenance and repair work happens during the "blanket" work window. Mitigation would be trying to balance the unavoidable need for more work time versus impact on BART riders.
- BART will be presenting a plan to the Board that has not been scheduled yet. K. Varnados asked when they move forward with the bus bridge into San Francisco, will the passenger be paying for that cost? T. Horton responded that normally the passenger does not pay for that cost.
- D. Schaible asked if there has been such an extended bus bridge? T. Horton responded, yes. An example would be



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>the West Oakland to San Francisco bus bridge for cross-over work. BART worked with AC Transit for this temporary solution.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• T. Horton continued to complete his financial report sharing that three tranches, totaling \$740M have been issued with no need to issue a new tranche. Currently, ESP is spending an average of \$7M per month, which will go up significantly once the Transbay Tube is moving in full swing. As mentioned at the last meeting, the Program did receive additional funds to exercise the five options for the Transbay Tube retrofit; however, since they are not part of the General Obligation Bond they will not be included in the financial report to the Citizens' Oversight Committee.• The Program has expended \$636,970,935 in general obligation bond funds, of the projected total of \$980,000,000.• Three-month average spending is \$6,908,081 per month.
<p><i>Public Comments</i></p>	<p>There was one member of the public, Mr. Zimmerman, who was present and provided the following comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Mr. Zimmerman has been a rider since BART started some 40 years ago.• He shared that he has become an unofficial earthquake specialist. He also commented that it is nice to see BART is on top of making the system safer in anticipation of another major earthquake.• He also offered two books by John L. Casey (NASA) to read if you are interested in learning more about earthquakes around safety: <i>Dark Winter</i> and <i>Upheaval</i>.• Mr. Zimmerman further provided comments on earthquake probability based on historical data and technical resources such as the U.S. Geological Society (USGS); providing greater technical detail regarding signals and detectors of earthquakes and various associations that track earthquake expectancies such as Quake Finders. He commented that between 1906 – 1989 there were not too many earthquakes and that prior to that time, they were frequent and many.• The public speaker concluded by expressing that he was very impressed with the information shared and discussed at the Committee meeting and conveyed sadness that



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>more people did not participate. Mr. Zimmerman said, <i>“Real good presentation and the public should be happy.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• T. Horton suggested a book he read by the author of <i>Cadillac Desert</i> (Book: <i>A Dangerous Place: California’s Unsettling Place</i> by Marc Reisner) which uses science, history and cultural commentary to discuss California’s inescapable fate of a catastrophic earthquake.• T. Horton closed out the discussion by sharing that a 7.5 earthquake is more likely than before, which happens to be our 500-year earthquake measure for the Earthquake Safety Program, which is in its final contracts. U.S. Geological Society (USGS) has not revised the probability on the Hayward fault. A discussion followed regarding major earthquakes throughout the world.• Additional non-GO Fund related questions regarding BART extensions into Milpitas and Berryessa and eventually San Jose were asked. T. Horton responded that the latest update is that the Milpitas and Berryessa Stations are expected to open in 2018. Phase II, which is the extension into Downtown San Jose is going through the environmental process and is not funded yet. Mr. Salazar shared that what is unique about this extension is that VTA is building the stations and extension and BART will own and operate it into Santa Clara County.
<p><i>Other Items</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Chairperson Derek Schaible disclosed that as of July 1, 2017 he has been appointed a member of the City and County of San Francisco Grand Jury. Mr. Schaible will recuse himself of anything related to the City and County of San Francisco and Golden Gate Transportation District.• D. Schaible asked if the work occurring at the two entrances at Civic Center is part of the Earthquake Safety work? T. Horton responded no and explained that BART is engaged in a Core Capacity Program that includes roughly the following: 5 new substations under federal program and under Measure RR will be able to do 25 more; 306 additional cars on top of cars already made; new communications based train control system that allows headway reduction between trains; and new Hayward Complex for storage of new trains. This program is designed to bring the system up to capacity based on ridership. Portions of this Core Capacity Program is funded



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	through Measure RR. BART needs to increase its core capacity.
<i>Next Meeting</i>	Members and staff tentatively agreed to meet Wednesday, January 10, 2018 at 4:30 pm.
<i>Adjournment</i>	The meeting was adjourned at 5:22 pm.