



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program**

Citizens' Oversight Committee Meeting

Wednesday, November 9, 2016 4:30 pm

**Conference Room 1700
Kaiser Center Tower, 17th Floor
300 Lakeside Drive, Oakland CA 94612**

Meeting Number	Meeting Date	Meeting Time
Term 5, Meeting 5	November 9, 2016	4:35 pm – 5:35 pm
Attendees	<i>Current Members</i> Ching Wu Clinton J. Loftman Derek Schaible Karen Varnado Sang Bak Lee	<i>Staff</i> Thomas Horton Molly McArthur Micaela Mazzini Jose Salaver <i>BART Director</i> Robert Raburn
Agenda Item	Action Taken	
<i>Welcome & Introductions</i>	M. McArthur called the meeting to order at approximately 4:35 pm. M. Mazzini took roll call and noted members in attendance.	
<i>Review of Administrative Matters</i>	M. McArthur reviewed the following administrative matter: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> April 28, 2016 meeting minutes were approved and will be posted on the BART website. M. McArthur stated that the Committee should prepare to provide a Report to the BART Board in the coming year. The following steps will be taken to prepare for this effort: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> BART staff will provide a draft report by summarizing the information discussed during previous meetings for the current term. The draft will be provided to the Committee for review and comment, and staff will make edits based on input from the Committee until all Committee members approve a final version. The first draft of the report will be provided to the committee members by mid-December. 	



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• D. Schaible, as Committee Chair, will present the Report, and all other members are welcome attend.• BART staff will work to schedule the Report to Board based on the Committee's decision to present in February 2017. <p>T. Horton mentioned that there will be three new Board Members in the new year including Bevan Dufty, Lateefah Simon and Debora Allen.</p> <p>M. McArthur announced that COC Member Ralph Mason had resigned from the Committee because he has moved out of the area. To fill his seat, the following changes to the COC membership were made:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• C. Wu was moved from the Seismic Retrofitting Seat to fill the Engineering Seat left vacant by R. Mason's departure.• D. Shaible was moved from the Seismic Retrofit Alternate to the Seismic Retrofitting Seat. <p>All members concurred with these changes.</p>
<i>Transbay Tube Updates</i>	<p>As requested by the Committee, T. Horton presented a lengthy update on the status of the Transbay Tube (TBT) retrofit and contracting. Among the points covered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The TBT is not vulnerable to structural problems, but it is vulnerable to leakage in excess of what the current pumping system can handle.• This is based on a maximum credible earthquake—one that only occurs about every 1000 years.• The first priority of the retrofit will be to curtail the leakage enough to be able to evacuate the TBT• The second priority of the retrofit will be to allow workers to make repairs after an earthquake• The plans for retrofit involve:<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Placement of a thin steel liner inside portions of the TBT○ Replacement the current pumps with larger pumps that can remove water at an increase rate



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

- The contract includes a base bid and a series of five additives
- The work will require a work train as well as a new spur track to be built to support the retrofit
- Single-tracking and a 1-hour delay in the start of system service during the weekdays. The delayed service start time of 5 am will affect about 2,600 weekday passengers.
- The overall contract for retrofit of the TBT is expected to last five years. Up to 2.5 years of active work inside the TBT will require service disruptions.

C. Wu asked why work isn't scheduled for the weekend when the nighttime shut down of BART service would allow for a longer work window.

T. Horton responded that it is more advantageous for the contractor to have a consistent schedule, rather than having days of differing work hours. He also mentioned that BART Maintenance relies on the weekend shutdown times to make critical repairs on the system and the TBT is used to run service equipment between the east and west sides of the Bay. Retrofit work in the TBT during this time would hinder the ability to get other maintenance work done.

Ching Wu asked if the steel would be painted steel.

T. Horton replied that the liners would be painted steel, which is a less-costly alternative, and is appropriate since it will not get wet in most cases

K. Varnado asked how long it would take to evacuate the TBT. T. Horton responded that the models are based on fully loaded trains needing four hours to evacuate.

The contract was expected to be awarded to the low-bid contractor in mid- November. However, it will be delayed because the BART Board expressed concerns about the early morning service disruption and have requested additional information before they will approve award of the contract. Among the concerns are:



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

- What are the demographics of the passengers that will be affected?
- Is a Title VI evaluation required?
- What outreach will be done to inform them?
- What mitigations will be in place to provide transit alternatives during the early morning service disruption?
- What will be the impacts to fare revenue?

T. Horton and R. Salazar expanded on a few details of Title VI of the Civil Rights Act and how it affects transportation issues, namely that decisions on service changes don't have disparate impacts on low-income, low-English, and minority communities.

T. Horton remarked that BART staff is looking into several options for mitigations for customers that would need transit alternatives if BART were to move forward with the contract and eventually delay the start of weekday service until 5 am. Among those are expansions of the current "Owl Service", bus bridges, or some type of limited BART service.

K. Varnado asked for clarification of how long the 1-hour early-morning delay to the start of service would last. T. Horton emphasized that while the overall contract is five years, the work inside the TBT will take place for about 2.5 years.

The Earthquake Safety Program has enough money to fund the base-bid of the contract. T. Horton added that the BART GM has expressed interest in identifying additional funds to cover the cost of the five additives.

C. Wu asked about the non-discrimination requirements for the project. T. Horton responded that although there are no federal goal requirements for minority contracting on this project, BART does have a non-discrimination policy to encourage contractors to make good faith efforts towards minority and women-owned business participation.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>C. Wu asked how long after the contract is awarded will the project begin. T. Horton responded that there are several factors that determine how soon a Notice to Proceed with construction can be issued, but in general it will be about 1-2 months after award by the BART Board.</p>
<i>Project Update</i>	<p>M. McArthur introduced Director Robert Raburn to the Committee.</p> <p>Director Raburn thanked the Committee for their participation and service.</p> <p>T. Horton provided an overview of the program's progress since the last COC Meeting, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The main update since the previous meeting on April 28, 2016 was that upgrades to the four piers in Richmond were completed since the previous Committee meeting.• Completed activities: 31 contracts have been completed to date.• All stations have been completed except Bay Fair (in construction), Fruitvale and Coliseum.• The contract that includes construction on Fruitvale and Coliseum stations is currently in litigation due to protests by one bidder. A decision by a judge on whether this contract can be awarded is expected in December.• Right of Way Acquisition: All acquisition is complete.• Design: All design is complete.• Procurement: the Fruitvale and Coliseum stations contract is in litigation due to a protest by a competing bidder. A decision by a judge on award is expected in December 2016; The TBT Retrofit is expected to go to the BART Board in December; One other remaining contract associated with retrofit of the TBT will issue Notice to Proceed in January project.• Construction: Three contracts are currently in construction including Bay Fair Station; Aerial structures along the Fremont Line (between Lake Merritt and Coliseum stations); and Track Procurement for the Spur Track construction.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>By next spring, the only contracts remaining will be for the Transbay Tube and the Fruitvale/Coliseum stations.</p> <p>C. Wu asked about the operability of the A-Line and R Line. T. Horton responded that the A-Line was designed for Life Safety because there was not enough funding to achieve operability. Due to very favorable soil conditions in the area, the R-Line was able to obtain operability with the upgrades to four piers in Richmond.</p>
<i>Financial Report</i>	<p>T. Horton provided an overview of the Program's finances and schedule, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The overall Program is anticipated to end in 2022.• The Fruitvale and Coliseum stations contract is expected to be complete in late 2019. The lengthy duration is due to restrictions on working at adjacent stations simultaneously as a way to lessen impacts to BART customers.• The Program has expended \$597,443,955 in general obligation bond funds, of the projected total of \$980,000,000.• Average spending is \$2,273,241 per month.
<i>Next Meeting</i>	<p>Members and staff tentatively agreed to meet Wednesday, February 8, 2017 at 4:30 pm.</p>
<i>Adjournment</i>	<p>The meeting was adjourned at approximately 5:35 pm.</p>