

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, CA 94612, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688
510-464-6000

A meeting of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) will be held on Wednesday, **November 09, 2022**, starting at 2:00 p.m. to 4:30 p.m.

Please Note: Pursuant to all necessary findings having been made by the Board of Directors of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (for itself as well as all subordinate legislative bodies) to continue remote public meetings in the manner contemplated under urgency legislation Assembly Bill No. 361, public participation for this meeting will be via teleconference only.

Presentation materials will be available via Legistar at <https://bart.legistar.com>

You may join the Committee Meeting via Zoom by calling **1-833-548-0282** and entering access code **831 3895 5029**; logging in to Zoom.com and entering access code **831 3895 5029**; or typing the following Zoom link into your web browser: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/583138955029>

If you wish to make a public comment:

- 1) Submit written comments via email to **evanloo@bart.gov**, using “public comment” as the subject line. Your comment will be provided to the Committee and will become a permanent part of the file. Please submit your comments as far in advance as possible. Emailed comments must be received before 12:00 p.m. on November 09, 2022, in order to be included in the record.
- 2) Call **1-833-548-0282**, enter access code **831 3895 5029**, dial *9 to raise your hand when you wish to speak, and dial *6 to unmute when you are requested to speak; log in to Zoom.com, enter access code **831 3895 5029**, and use the raise hand feature; or join the Committee Meeting via the Zoom link (<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/83138955029>), and use the raise hand feature.

Public comment is limited to two (2) minutes per person.

BART provides service/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited English proficient who wish to address Committee matters. A request must be made within one and five days in advance of Board/Committee meetings, depending on the service requested. Please contact the Office of the District Secretary at (510) 464-6083 for information.

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, CA 94612, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688
510-464-6000

AGENDA, November 09, 2022

1. Roll Call of BATF members. (Information) 5 minutes
Self-Introductions: Staff and Guests.
2. Public Comment. (Information)
Opportunity to comment on items not on the agenda.
(Two minutes per speaker)
3. Approval of September 22, 2022 Meeting Minutes. 5 minutes
(Information/Action)
4. Accessibility Update (Elevator Enclosure Fare Gates). 20 minutes
(Information/Action)
5. Update on Measure-RR Funded Safe Routes to BART Grant 20 minutes
Program. (Information)
6. BART Station Access Signage Standards Website – 5 minutes
Reminder.(Information/Action)
7. Review and Approve Year 2023 BATF Scheduled Meeting Dates. 10 minutes
(Information/Action)
8. BATF Holiday Reception Planning for December 2022 – 15 minutes
Discussion. (Information/Action)
9. Member Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
10. Staff Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
11. Chairperson Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
12. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics. 5 minutes
Next meeting scheduled: December 14, 2022.
(Information/Action)
13. Adjournment.

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting **DRAFT** Minutes
September 22, 2022

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Catherine Callahan
3. Clarence Fischer
4. David Fritz
5. Don Queen
6. Emily Witkin
7. Gerry Newell
8. Hale Zukas
9. Herb Hastings (2nd Vice-Chair)
10. Janet Abelson
11. Janice Armigo Brown (Vice-Chair)
12. Larry Bunn - ABSENT
13. Marjorie (Marji) McWee
14. Randall Glock (Chair)
15. Roland Wong
16. Shay Roberson – ABSENT
17. Valerie Buell
18. VACANT

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Laura Timothy
Bob Franklin

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Byron Toma (BART Staff)
Jumana Nabti (BART Staff)
Ahmad Rassai (BART Staff)
Mayra Perez (Captioner)
Alicia Garispe (Captioner)

Robert Acuna (Guest)
Joe Kunzler (Guest)
Sheela Gunn-Cushman (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Roger Acuna introduced himself

Joe Kunzler asked BATF advisory committee to continue to support the mask mandate on BART.

3. Approval of September 22, 2022 Meeting Minutes

Clarence Fischer asked if August's meetings should have been July's meeting minutes to approve. Elena Van Loo mentioned July's meeting was suspended due to Zoom's technical issues and that is why July's minutes will not be available.

Clarence Fischer moved approval of the September 22, 2022 meeting minutes. Janice Armigo Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, one (1) abstention

4. How to Run an Effective Public Meeting – Refresher

Byron Toma, BART legal department presented, "How to run an effective public meeting – Refresher."

Byron Toma went over "The BIG Picture":

- Parliamentary law is a system of maintaining order in organizations-Provides an approved and uniform method of conducting meetings in a fair, orderly, and expeditious manner
- Respect for law is a basic characteristic of democratic governments-This respect is clearly shown by a willingness to practice an orderly method of procedure in organizations so as to follow the will of the majority, to protect the rights of the minority, and to protect the interests of those absent
- BART Board of Directors has adopted Alice Sturgis's Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure to govern its affairs and, unless otherwise indicated, the governance of subordinate bodies

Byron Toma went over three Alice Sturgis's Philosophy:

- Alice Sturgis considered principles more important than rules
- She stressed the need to understand the "why," behind every procedure
- She held that when there is a conflict between common sense and archaic ritual, common sense should prevail.

Byron Toma went over some key principles:

- All members have equal rights, privileges, and obligations; rules must be administered impartially
- The minority has rights which must be protected
- Full and free discussion of all motions, reports, and other items of business is a right of all members
- In doing business, the simplest and most direct procedure should be used
- Logical precedence governs introduction and disposition of motions
- Only one question can be considered at a time
- Members must be recognized by the chair and have obtained the floor
- No one may speak more than twice on the same question w/o permission of the assembly. No member may speak a second time on the same question if anyone who has not spoken on that question wishes to do so
- In voting, members have the right to know at all times what motion is before the assembly and what affirmative and negative votes mean

Byron Toma did a summary in steps in handling a motion:

- A member raises hand and address the chairperson
- The chairperson recognizes the member
- The member states the motion
- Another member seconds the motion
- The chairperson restates the motion, thus placing it before the committee for consideration
- The committee may discuss the motion if it is debatable and amend the motion if it is amendable
- The chairperson takes the vote
- The chairperson announces the result

Byron Toma shared, "Did you know":

- Under Sturgis, the Chair maintains the right to vote
- A motion requires (at least) a majority vote to pass
- Where a motion would limit the rights of members, a 2/3 vote is required
- Associate member cannot vote
- BATF members who have a direct personal gain by voting may not vote
- Under Sturgis (p. 135) abstentions do not count

- Under Sturgis (p. 136), the result of a vote is a tie, the motion fails to pass
- Seconding a motion merely indicates that the member wishes the motion to be considered by the committee; it is not necessarily an endorsement of the motion

Byron Toma shared “Words of wisdom regarding to meetings”:

- BATF members should be careful not to engage in seriatim or serial meetings, i.e., discussions about matters that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the BATF that are discussed outside regularly noticed meetings by a majority of the Board
- Beware of emailing everyone on the Board regarding your point of view
- Beware of speaking to four other members of the committee about pending matters before the body
- Don’t use third parties to press your point of view to other members of the Board
- BATF members should likewise be careful not to disclose what happened in closed session deliberations
- In short, those things intended to be public must be public, and those things intended to be confidential must be treated confidentially

Byron Toma shared “Words of wisdom regarding public meetings-Comments and announcements:

- The public must be allowed to participate in a meaningful way in the discussion of agenda items.
- The public must be allowed to comment on matters outside the agenda.
- The public must be allowed to criticize elected officials, appointed officials, staff, public policy, and District operations.
- Only disruptive behavior is subject to taking appropriate and measured sanctions.
- Questions from the public should be taken through the Chair.
- Questions from the public, if calling for deliberative action by the body, should be referred to staff for possible future agendas.
- An announcement that entertains an exchange will be viewed as an unnoticed agenda item and will be deemed a violation of the Brown Act.

Byron Toma went over “Final words of wisdom”:

- Don’t get bogged down with detail
- Use common sense
- Have reference materials readily available.
- Take notes
- Practice

- Take care of only one thing at a time
- No business without a quorum. Individual BATF members do not have the power to act independently. They are members of a body and therefore may not speak or act for the body unless given specific authority by the body. An individual doing so will be individually responsible for their own actions

Byron Toma shared this presentation, resource, was from, Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure (4th edition), by Alice Sturgis.

Don Queen thanked Byron Toma for a great summary of his presentation. Byron Toma mentioned there's Robert Rules of Order which is different from Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure from Alice Sturgis. Alice Sturgis is more straight forward, common sense, where Robert's Rule of Order is very detailed, technical.

Elena Van Loo mentioned she will email members the complete PDF version of Byron Toma's presentation per member's request.

5. BART's Station Access And Wayfinding Update

Jumana Nabti presented, "BART's Station access and wayfinding update," and she shared she presented on signage and wayfinding update back in November of 2021.

Jumana Nabti did an overview, update:

- Phase 5: Station Access Signage & Wayfinding overview
 - Current condition
 - Confusing – does not encourage transit use
 - Does not reflect current management practices
 - Station access Signage & Wayfinding guidelines
 - Addresses all access modes
 - Bus bay numbering
 - Curb zones & bike parking
 - Parking
 - Vehicular & pedestrian wayfinding
 - High-impact, low-cost improvement
 - Since last presentation to BATF
 - Refines signage designs (minor changes)
 - Draft guidelines document online
- Design Criteria
 - Intuitive designs that will help users quickly make decisions
 - Reflect and work cohesively with regional signage/wayfinding standards

- Address needs of all types of users
 - New vs. regular users
 - People with varying abilities – ie; low vision, color blindness, non-English speakers
 - Those accessing the station via all modes
- Standard text, icon, (potentially) color for each facility group
- Signage types refer to each other as one cohesive suite
- Identification signage – Curb zones
 - Use standard colors, text, and icons to ensure legibility for all users
 - New icons for paratransit, 15 minutes waiting, Ride App loading
- Bus bay identification signage supports
 - Passenger experience
 - Station management & Operations
- Buses – Identification signage
- Bus bay numbering methodology
- Parking – Signage overview
 - Use standard colors, text, and icons to ensure legibility for all users
 - New icons and names for parking sub-types
- Vehicular wayfinding
- Pedestrian wayfinding
- Color-blindness tests
 - Protanopia type color-blindness
 - Deuteranopia type color-blindness

Jumana Nabti shared the next steps and funding:

- Receive public & stakeholder input on draft guidelines online; bart.gov/signage
- Feed standards into MTC Regional Mapping & Wayfinding project
- Upcoming installations: Millbrae, North Berkeley
- Develop implementation plan for bus signage at ten (10) stations
- MTC Regional Mapping & Wayfinding project
 - Transformation action plan – Accelerated item
 - Project kickoff: 09-14-2022
 - Scope includes
 - Update of standards for all transit signage and mapping, including display cases
 - Transit branding
 - Pilots in Sonoma, solano, and East Counties

Herb Hastings asked about the numbers on signages at bus stations, especially at some stations, there are two-sided, separate parking lots with two separate bus

stations on either side, like Dublin/Pleasanton BART Station. Jumana Nabti mentioned there would be clear signages to which bus stop to go to if there are two-sided stations with bus stops on each side.

David Fritz mentioned signages to escalator locations in the stations could be improved.

David Fritz stated he rode two different newer Fleet of the Future (FOF) trains and mentioned the electronic maps were not working and it was a black screen. He suggested that paper maps be installed in the FOF just the ones in the older BART trains and added this is part of wayfinding.

Sheela Gunn-Cushman asked whether any comment and feedback from people who are low vision or blind were solicited. Jumana Nabti mentioned she reached out to Lighthouse for the Blind and Visually Impaired in San Francisco for their advice and has been to numerous accessibility task forces.

6. Yearly Nominations and Elections of BATF Officers: Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2nd Vice-Chair

Randall Glock opened the agenda and asked if any members would like to make a comment before proceeding with nominations and elections. No comments from BATF members.

Elena Van Loo led the agenda item with assistance from Laura Timothy and Bob Franklin.

Elena Van Loo mentioned David Fritz is the newest member and will be able to vote, as the BART Board confirmed his membership on September 08, 2022.

Chairperson election:

Herb Hastings, Gerry Newell, and Randall Glock were nominated for Chairperson. All three did a short speech as to why they would be a good candidate as Chairperson.

Voting results for Chairperson:

- Randall Glock – eight (8) in favor, zero (0) against
- Gerry Newell – six (6) in favor, zero (0) against
- Herb Hastings did not receive enough votes to advance to the final two candidates.

Abstention (s) – one (1)

Vice-Chairperson election:

Gerry Newell and Herb Hastings were nominated for Vice-Chairperson. Both did a short speech as to why they would be a good candidate as Vice-Chairperson.

Voting results for Vice-Chairperson:

- Gerry Newell – seven (7) in favor, zero (0) against
- Herb Hastings – four (4) in favor, zero (0) against

Abstention (s) – one (1)

2nd Vice-Chairperson election:

Herb Hasting was nominated for 2nd Vice-Chairperson.

Voting results for 2nd Vice-Chairperson:

- Herb Hastings – ten (10) in favor, zero (0) against

Abstention (s) – two (2)

Elena Van Loo announced the new Chairperson is Randall Glock, the Vice-Chairperson is Gerry Newell, and the 2nd Vice-Chair is Herb Hastings will serve for one year.

7. Member Announcements

No member announcements

8. Staff Announcements

Elena Van Loo congratulated David Fritz as the newest BATF member. She shared David Fritz’s appointment was confirmed by the BART Board of Directors.

Randall Glock asked if there has been any conversation about having BATF meetings go back to in-person meetings since the BART Board of Directors started doing so. Elena Van Loo stated she has been communicating with BART’s legal department on how to proceed on having in-person meetings. Details still need to be worked out.

9. Chairperson Announcements

Randall Glock thanked Janice Armigo Brown for her time as the Vice-Chairperson in the he past year. He welcomed Gerry Newell as the new Vice-Chairperson and Herb Hastings as the 2nd Vice-Chairperson.

Gerry Newell stated he is honored to be the Vice-Chairperson and added going into the new year will be a great year.

Herb Hastings shared that he attended BART's 50th Anniversary celebration at Lake Merritt on September 10, 2022. He thought the event was well organized and a lot of people attended.

Janice Armigo Brown attended the 50th Anniversary celebration and mentioned it was a wonderful event.

Janice Armigo Brown stated she was honored to serve as the Vice-Chair for the past year.

10. Future Agenda Topics – Member Suggest Topics

- Approve Year 2023 BATF Scheduled Meeting Dates
- November 09, 2022 approved scheduled meeting – Discussion
- BATF Holiday Reception Planning for December 2022 – Discussion
- Silicon Valley BART Extension
 - Presented at the BART Board of Directors meeting on September 22, 2022

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 4:27 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, October 27, 2022.

2023
BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF)
Regular Schedule Meeting Dates

Regular monthly meetings of the **BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF)** shall be held every fourth Thursday of each month, with exception for November and December 2023, due to holidays,

BATF meetings will be held via Teleconferencing until further notice.

- **January 26, 2023, Thursday**
- **February 23, 2023, Thursday**
- **March 23, 2023, Thursday**
- **April 27, 2023, Thursday**
- **May 25, 2023, Thursday**
- **June 22, 2023, Thursday**
- **July 27, 2023, Thursday**
- **August 24, 2023, Thursday**
- **September 28, 2023, Thursday**
- **October 26, 2023, Thursday**
- **November 08, 2023, or November 15, 2023, Wednesday**
- **December 13, 2023, Wednesday**

All BATF meetings starts at 2:00 pm and ends around 4:30pm.