

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688  
510-464-6000

**NOTICE OF MEETING AND AGENDA  
BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE (BATF)**

September 24, 2020

A meeting of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) will be held on Thursday, September 24, 2020, from 2:00 p.m. – 4:00 p.m.

**Please note: Pursuant to Governor Newsom’s Executive Order N-29-20 and the California Shelter-in-Place mandate, public participation for this meeting will be via teleconference and video conference only.**

Join Zoom Meeting: <https://zoom.us/j/9604603080>

One tap mobile: +16699009128,,9604603080#

Dial by your location: +1 669 900 9128

Meeting ID: 960 460 3080#

If you are participating via phone, please press \*6 to mute or unmute yourself. Press \*9 to raise or lower your hand or to get the attention of the chair or hosts.

**AGENDA**

1. Roll Call of BATF members. (Information) 5 minutes  
Self-Introductions: Staff and Guests.
2. Public Comments. (Information) 5 minutes  
Opportunity to comment on items not on the agenda.  
(Two minutes per speaker)
3. Approval of August 27, 2020 Draft Minutes. (Information/Action) 5 minutes
4. Riding Together: Bay Area Healthy Transit Plan. (Information/Action) 15 minutes
5. Protocols of Riding BART Elevators During COVID-19. 10 minutes  
(Information/Action)

- |     |   |            |
|-----|---|------------|
| 6.  | November and December 2020 BATF Meeting Plans.<br>(Information/Action)  | 10 minutes |
| 7.  | 19th Street Oakland BART Station Modernization Updates.<br>(Information/Action)   | 10 minutes |
| 8.  | Potential Changes to BATF By-Laws. (Information/Action)   | 15 minutes |
| 9.  | Yearly Nominations and Elections of Officers:<br>Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair (Information/Action)                 | 15 minutes |
| 10. | Member Announcements. (Information)   | 5 minutes  |
| 11. | Staff Announcements. (Information)  | 5 minutes  |
| 12. | Chairperson Announcements. (Information)  | 5 minutes  |
| 13. | Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics. (Information/Action)<br><b><u>Next meeting scheduled:</u></b> Thursday, October 22, 2020 | 5 minutes  |
| 14. | Adjournment.  |            |

BART provides service/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited English proficient who wish to address Committee matters. A request must be made within one and five days in advance of Board/Committee meetings, depending on the service requested. Please contact the Office of the District Secretary at (510) 464-6083 for information.

## **Material attached for September 24, , 2020 BATF meeting:**

- August 27, 2020 draft minute
- Draft of BATF By-Laws edits

### Future Agenda Topics:

1. Meet the current BART General Manager (annually)
2. Meet the current Deputy General Manager (annually)
3. Meet Customer Access and Accessibility Managers (annually)
4. Armando Sandoval meet with members – Update BART Police Department (annually)
5. Meet BART Chief of Police (annually)
6. Report of accomplishments – BATF members (annually)
7. Update, establish annual, strategic goals – BATF members (annually)
8. Fiscal Year Budget – Finance Department Presents (annually)
9. Provide a letter to BART Board of Directors’ BATF letter of accomplishments; highlights (annually)
10. Station announcements (emergency and non-emergency)
11. Announcements on board trains (not always clear or too load, or too low)
12. Elevators: Odor concerns – Cleanup efforts
13. How to report when things are not working in the BART system via bart.gov
14. Test new elevator(s) – comply with ADA
15. Low income fare discount pilot program – Under the Clipper program
16. Bay Fair BART Station Modernization
17. Coliseum BART Station Modernization
18. Powell BART Station Modernization
  - a. Powell BART Station restrooms update
19. West Oakland BART Station Modernization
20. El Cerrito del Norte BART Station Modernization
21. Union City Station Modernization
22. 19<sup>th</sup> Street Station Modernization - Update
23. Status, updates of signages (some signs are too bright)
24. How to use BART Watch App
25. Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force – How other public transportation making effort to spread of COVID-19
26. Text BART Police Introduction

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT  
BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**

**DRAFT Minutes**  
August 27, 2020

**1. Self-Introduction of Members, Staff, and Guests:**

Members:

Alan Smith (2nd Vice-Chair)  
Anita Ortega  
Catherine Callahan  
Chris Mullin  
Clarence Fischer  
Don Queen  
Emily Witkin  
Gerry Newell (Vice-Chair) - ABSENT  
Hale Zukas  
Herb Hastings  
Janet Abelson  
Janice Armigo Brown  
Marjorie (Marji) McWee  
Mussie Gebre - ABSENT  
Randall Glock (Chair)  
Roland Wong  
Valerie Buell

**BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:**

Elena Van Loo  
Laura Timothy  
Bob Franklin

**Director(s), Speakers, Staff, and Guests of the Public:**

Robert Raburn (BART Board Director)  
Sadie Graham (Staff)  
Camille Tsao (Staff)  
Patrick Quinn (Staff)  
Helise Cohn (Staff)  
Danielle Stephens (Captioner)  
Heather Urzua (Captioner)

Peter Lim (Guest)  
Helen Walsh (Guest)  
Hong Mei (Guest)

## **2. Public Comments**

No public comments.

## **3. Approval of June 25, 2020 and July 23, 2020 Draft Minutes**

Alan Smith moved the approval of the amended June 25, 2020 meeting minutes. Janet Abelson seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with twelve (12) in favor, zero (0) against, zero (0) abstention

Herb Hastings moved the approval of the amended July 23, 2020 meeting minutes. Emily Witkin seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eight (8) in favor, two (2) against, two (2) abstentions

## **4. BART Transbay Rail Crossing Program – Updates**

Sadie Graham and Camille Tsao gave a PowerPoint presentation on the item. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after the presentation.

Sadie Graham and Camille Tsao presented on the New Transbay Rail Crossing Program. The New Transbay Rail Crossing Program will include a new connection between Oakland and San Francisco, which will make rail and transit the mode of choice for trips throughout Northern California, including the greater Bay Area, Monterey Bay Area, Sacramento Area, and parts of the Central Valley, also known as the Megaregion. Sadie Graham added the funding will go through the Capital Funding program.

Goals and objectives for the New Transbay Rail Crossing Program:

- Transform the passenger experience
  - Provide better service
  - Improve reliability and system performance
  - Build ridership

- Enhance the community and livability of the region
  - Connect people and places
  - Improve safety, health, and air quality
  - Advance equity
- Support economics growth and global competitiveness
  - Improve access to opportunity and employment
  - Connect major economic, research and educational centers
  - Enable transit-supportive land use
- Advance environmental stewardship and protection
  - Increase climate change resilience
  - Reduce greenhouse gas emissions
  - Conserve resources

Camille Tsao shared the New Transbay Rail Crossing Program will go through phases starting at 0 (zero) phase to 3 (three) phases that started in 2019 and will go until around 2028.

Herb Hastings asked if other transit agencies will be involved with the Transbay Rail Crossing Program. Camille Tsao stated that other transit agencies like AC Transit, VTA, SF Muni, Caltrain, etc. will be part of this project.

Sadie Graham stated that she or staff in the Planning and Development Department will share with BATF members up-to-date New Transbay Rail Crossing Program progress as we move forward.

Roland Wong requested the PowerPoint presentation to be emailed to BATF members.

Randall Glock thanked Sadie Graham and Camille Tsao for their presentation.

## **5. New Embarcadero BART Station Elevator**

Patrick Quinn gave a PowerPoint presentation on the item. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after the presentation.

Patrick Quinn shared that the Embarcadero BART Station will have an additional elevator that will go between the concourse level and the BART platform level. The goal is to install a new concourse elevator and make sure this elevator will be more reliable.

Patrick Quinn shared the benefits:

- Add redundancy
- Improve customer access
- Have more options to go down to the platform
- Reduce travel time to the platform

Patrick Quinn added that he anticipates the new elevator at Embarcadero BART Station will be completed by August 2023 on the north end of the station.

Patrick Quinn clarified that BART will be able to program the elevator to travel directly between the concourse level and the BART platform level, bypassing the Muni platform level, which will reduce travel time in the elevator.

Patrick Quinn described the new elevator as a glass elevator with glass doors, so passengers can see through the doors.

Roland Wong requested for the PowerPoint presentation to be emailed to BATF members.

## **6. Clipper® Start – Means-Based Fare Discount Program Pilot**

Helise Cohn gave a PowerPoint presentation on the item. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after the presentation.

Helise Cohn introduced herself and mentioned she works for Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) that is in charge of the Clipper® Card programs. She shared that the Clipper® Start, Means-Based Fare Discount Program is a pilot and expressed there is a growing need for discounted transit fares for low-income adults.

Helise Cohn shared goals for the pilot program:

- Awareness
- Positive experience
- Financial viability
- Administrative feasibility
- Affordability
- Increased access

Helise Cohn mentioned these are the transit agencies involved in this pilot program: BART, Caltrain, Golden Gate Transit and SFMTA. She added the program will be offered through Clipper® and the pilot is scheduled to last for eighteen (18) months.

She shared there is a comprehensive outreach plan to promote the program through social media, advertising, and community outreach, as well as promotion from participating transit agencies.

Helise Cohn shared how individuals can apply by computer or mobile phone (smart phone), or by filling out a brochure. The requirements for the Clipper® Start, Means-Based Fare Discount Program are to supply proof of identity, proof of income, a Bay Area mailing address, and to answer survey questions. She added that if you are getting unemployment checks, you will not qualify.

Helise Cohn stated that members of the public have questions that they may contact Clipper® Start Customer Service by calling 1-856-614-9149 or emailing [help@clipperstart.com](mailto:help@clipperstart.com)

Randall Glock clarified the difference between a disability or a senior discount card vs. Clipper® Start, Means-Based Fare Discount Program. People with a disability or senior discount card receive more of a discount than the Clipper® Start, Means-Based Fare Discount Program, and shared that this presentation is something you can pass on to family members or friends who may need this service.

## **7. BATF By-Laws Discussion**

Randall Glock led the agenda item to look into changing the BATF By-Laws under Article V.A.4-Termination of Membership, which requires BATF members to reside in the three counties in the BART District, to have potential members live in the BART service area, like San Mateo or Santa Clara County).

Janet Abelson voiced concerns for those who are paying taxes living within in the BART District versus those who are not paying taxes because they do not live within the BART District.

Valerie Buell expressed as long as a person is able to take BART where there is BART services, she thinks it is fair for anyone who is interested to become a BATF member within or out of the BART District.

Alan Smith moved to change the BATF By-Laws under Article V.A.4-Termination of Membership, from “A member has ceased to reside in the BART District,” to “A member moves out of the BART service area.” Valerie Buell seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with twelve (12) in favor, one (1) against, zero (0) abstention



Bob Franklin stated staff will do a BATF By-Law draft for review and approval and then bring it to BART legal department for review.

## **8. Member Announcements**

No member announcements

## **9. Staff Announcements**

Elena Van Loo reminded members that nominations and elections of officers- Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair are scheduled for the next BATF meeting, September 24, 2020.

Laura Timothy let members know Jessica Kuo is no longer working for BART.

## **10. Chairperson Announcements**

No Chair announcements

## **11. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics**

- Draft of BATF By-Laws changes under Article V-Termination of Membership
- Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force
- Updates on a number of BART Station projects

## **12. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned until the next regularly scheduled meeting, **September 24, 2020.**

[Meeting adjourned at 4:07 pm]

San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District  
BART Accessibility Task Force  
By-Laws  
September 2017

**ARTICLE I – NAME OF TASK FORCE**

The name of this task force shall be the BART Accessibility Task Force and may be referred to as “BATF.”

**ARTICLE II – MISSION STATEMENT**

The mission of the BATF is to advise the BART Board of Directors and staff on ways to maintain and improve the accessibility of the BART system for people with disabilities and for seniors. This mission is consistent with the District’s Strategic Plan goal to encourage public input.

**ARTICLE III – RESPONSIBILITIES**

A. Work with staff to:

1. Review, analyze and prepare recommendations on issues and policies, capital projects, compliance with local, state and federal legislation relating to the provision of accessible services at BART and other issues that might be brought to the BATF by the public, staff or the Board.
2. Develop recommendations which take into consideration the needs of people with different disabilities and seniors.
3. Participate in the development of proposed new policies and the planning and implementation of new services that affect people with disabilities and seniors who use BART.
4. Provide a public forum for discussion of all BART related issues concerning people with disabilities and seniors.
5. Act as a resource group to BART staff who interact with people with disabilities and seniors to answer complaints, to develop new programs, to solve architectural problems in the system, to conduct staff disability trainings, and other areas as needed.

B. In order to accomplish these responsibilities BATF shall:

1. Educate themselves about the BART system, the budget process, the administrative process, the ADA as it relates to transportation accessibility issues, the project cost-analysis process, and the Brown Act.
2. Establish annual goals for BATF.
3. Make reports or recommendations to appropriate BART staff through the staff member designated to support the BATF as needed.
4. Report to the BART Board of Directors and send additional reports or recommendations as needed, which reports may be accompanied by a staff report as appropriate.
5. Recuse themselves from any matter before the Task Force in which they have a financial interest.
6. Complete ethics training required by the State of California.

## **ARTICLE IV – MEMBERSHIP**

### **A. COMPOSITION**

Members should be active BART users, who are people with disabilities or seniors over the age of 65. Except as stated above, BATF does not discriminate based on race, color, origin, sex, religion, sexual orientation, disability, or age in its membership.

The BATF shall be composed up to 18 members. The number of active members and the actual vote on actions shall be included on all communications to the Board and staff. If there are more than 18 applicants for the BATF, BART staff shall recommend 18 from among all those endorsed by the BATF, taking into consideration the goal of including people from all the parts of the BART system representing a diversity of disabilities and ages. There shall be no minimum number of members.

Some exceptions may be made to these eligibility criteria. The membership may include up to two non-disabled persons with special knowledge or technical training regarding the transportation needs for a particular disability.

## B. TERM OF OFFICE

The term for each member of the BATF shall end on June 30 of odd-numbered years or when the BART Board announces appointments and reappointments for a new term, whichever occurs later.

## C. NOMINATION AND SELECTION PROCESS

During the 2nd quarter of each odd-numbered calendar year, the staff liaison will contact each member to determine if they are interested in continuing to serve.

In addition, staff shall seek members through notices, in stations, on the BART website, contact with underrepresented disabled groups and seniors, and other means as appropriate. Out of four consecutive meetings, an interested applicant must attend three and then apply for membership. Applicants must be endorsed by the members of the BATF through a majority vote. Their names are submitted by the BATF staff liaison to the BART Board of Directors for final approval. The BATF staff liaison will notify the applicant of the Board's decision regarding their application.

## D. VOTING RIGHTS

Each member shall be entitled to one vote and may cast that vote on each matter submitted to a vote at a meeting of the BATF. Proxy, telephonic, electronic, or absentee ballots shall not be permitted.

## E. RESIGNATION

Members may resign by notifying the BATF Chair or staff liaison, who then will inform the staff and BART Board of Directors.

## **ARTICLE V – TERMINATION OF MEMBERSHIP**

A. A member's appointment to the BATF shall be terminated upon a determination by the BATF that:

1. A member has missed four regular meetings in a calendar year. Because it is important that all views be represented at meetings, there is no provision for excused absences.
2. At the time of appointment, a member materially misrepresented information on their application.

3. A member has engaged in a consistent pattern of disruptive behavior in BATF or other BART related meetings which includes use of slurs, derogatory comments, or any other conduct, whether physical, verbal or written directed at another person or based upon another person's race, color, origin, sex, religion, sexual orientation, disability, or age.

**4. A member has ceased to reside in the BART service area.**

5. Notification has been received that a person is not available to serve as a member.

6. A member has failed to complete the required ethics training.

B. Staff liaison will notify the terminated individual about the termination, first by e-mail. If there is no response, then by phone. If there no response, then the individual will be notified about the end of their membership during the next two regularly scheduled meetings.

## **ARTICLE VI – OFFICERS**

### **A. CHAIR**

The BATF shall elect from its membership a Chair. The Chair will work with BART staff to develop an agenda, lead meetings and keep order, appoint members to subcommittees, present reports to the BART Board of Directors, and prepare and sign all letters, reports and other communications of the BATF. The Chair shall perform such other duties as may be requested from time to time by the BATF or BART staff.

### **B. VICE-CHAIR**

The BATF shall elect from its membership a Vice-Chair who, in the absence or inability of the Chair to serve, shall have all of the powers and shall perform all of the duties of the Chair. The Vice-Chair shall perform such other duties from time to time as may be requested by the Chair.

### **C. 2nd VICE-CHAIR**

The BATF shall elect from its membership a 2nd Vice-Chair who, in the absence or inability of the Chair and Vice-Chair to serve, shall have all the powers and shall perform all of the duties of the Chair and Vice-Chair. The 2nd Vice-Chair shall perform such other duties from time to time as may be requested by the Chair.

## D. ELECTION OF CHAIR, VICE-CHAIR AND 2ND VICE-CHAIR

### 1. Term of Office

The officers of the BATF shall serve for one year or until the next election is held.

### 2. Nomination

At the September meeting, nominations and election of officers will be held. People may self-nominate or be nominated by other members. Nominations will be accepted from the floor prior to the close of nominations on the day of elections. The election of officers shall be by simple majority vote.

### 3. Vacancy

A vacancy in any office shall be filled by election for the unexpired term.

### 4. Temporary or Permanent Vacancies

If the Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2nd Vice-Chair are absent from any meeting and/or are unable to act, the meeting shall be called to order by staff. The staff shall immediately call for the selection of a Temporary Presiding Officer.

### 5. Failure to Elect

If the BATF fails to elect a Chair, Vice-Chair, or 2nd Vice-Chair, the existing Chair, Vice-Chair, or 2nd Vice-Chair shall continue to serve until the BATF elects a successor.

## E. STAFF SUPPORT

The BART General Manager or her designee shall designate a person to serve as BATF staff to prepare meeting notices, agendas, and minutes as required and to serve as liaison between BATF and other BART staff and the Board of Directors.

## **ARTICLE VII – MEETINGS**

### **A. REGULAR MEETINGS**

All regular and special meetings of the BATF shall be conducted in accordance with the Ralph M. Brown Act. Meeting agendas shall be posted in a public place in the same manner as agendas posted for meetings of the BART Board of Directors.

Meetings will be open to the public, held in a location accessible to people with disabilities, and within the geographical boundaries of the BART District.

At least 72 hours prior to a regular meeting, an agenda must be posted which contains a brief general description of each item to be transacted or discussed at the meeting.

Members of the public have the right to directly address BATF during public comment for issues which are not on the agenda, or for any item on the agenda, before or during the consideration of the item. Agendas will be mailed or emailed (based on preference) to members of the BATF and to persons requesting them according to the requirements of the Brown Act.

### **B. SPECIAL MEETINGS**

Special meetings may be called by the Chair when in the opinion of the Chair the business of the BATF requires it or by the request of a majority of the BATF membership. Notice for special meetings will conform to the requirements of the Brown Act. No other business shall be considered at such meeting.

### **C. QUORUM**

A majority of the appointed members of the must be present in order to constitute a quorum necessary for the transaction of the business of the BATF.

### **D. ADVICE AND DECISIONS OF THE BATF**

All decisions of the BATF which require a formal vote shall be made only after an affirmative vote of a majority of its members present and voting. Minutes of meetings, as well as any special reports or communications desired by the BATF, shall be forwarded by staff to the BART Board of Directors. In addition, the Chair or a designee may present reports to the BART Board of Directors or an appropriate committee in person.

### **E. BATF MEETING EXPENSES FOR MEMBERS**

BART will cover travel costs on public transit for BATF members to attend regular or special BATF meetings.

## **ARTICLE VIII – AGENDAS, MINUTES, RULES OF CONDUCT, AND ACCOMODATIONS**

### **A. AGENDAS**

Members may contact the chair to have items put on the agenda. Also, each meeting agenda shall have an item when members may ask to put items on future agendas.

The Chair shall schedule items on the agenda in consultation with the staff liaison. Staff shall be responsible for distributing the final agenda and preparing or compiling the associated agenda materials for each meeting. Agenda materials shall normally be mailed to members one week prior to each meeting, but agenda distribution shall always conform to the requirements of the Brown Act.

### **B. MINUTES**

Draft minutes of each BATF meeting shall be prepared by staff and distributed to BATF members and others together with the agenda for the next meeting. Minutes shall be made final after a majority vote of those BATF members who were present at the meeting.

### **C. RULES OF CONDUCT**

All regular and special meetings of the BATF shall be conducted in accordance with these bylaws and with the Rules of Order used by the BART Board. In case of conflict, these bylaws shall take precedence.

The Chair, or a member appointed by the Chair, may represent the BATF to the BART Board of Directors with prior notice to the BATF and staff if possible. No member shall represent the BATF or BART to the general public unless authorized by the Board of Directors or its designee.

### **D. ACCOMMODATIONS FOR MEMBERS AND THE PUBLIC**

On-going arrangements will be made with individual BATF members to accommodate their disability-related need for alternative formats for minutes, correspondence, exhibits and other graphic information, sign language interpreters, and captioning. Non-routine requests for accommodation must be made in a timely fashion.



The general public can also request routine or one-time provision of materials in alternative formats by making a request to the BART staff liaison in a timely fashion in advance of scheduled meeting times.

## **ARTICLE IX – SUBCOMMITTEES**

The Chair has authority with concurrence by the BATF to appoint subcommittees and/or ad-hoc committees to address issues as needed.

## **ARTICLE X – BYLAWS AMENDMENTS**

The bylaws may be proposed for amendment or repeal by a motion that is made and seconded and passed by a three-fourths (3/4) vote of members present at any regular or special meeting. In addition, written notice of the proposed amendment must be agetized and distributed given at the meeting prior to that at which action will be taken. The notice must contain both the original language and the proposed amending language to the bylaws. The proposed bylaws change must be reviewed by the BART legal staff and will be made final upon approval by the BART Board of Directors or their designee.

In addition to the procedure above, any bylaw may be altered, amended or annulled at any time by a majority vote of the BART Board of Directors after consultation with or by recommendation of the BATF and approval of BART legal staff.

## **ARTICLE XI – TERM OF BATF**

BATF Term: The BATF shall remain in existence until discharged by action of the BART Board of Directors. The Board may periodically review the need for the BATF and may modify its composition, structure or bylaws after consultation with the BATF.

Grace Crunican,  
General Manager