

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

Board of Directors  
Minutes of the 1,873rd Meeting  
November 19, 2020

A regular meeting of the Board of Directors was held on November 19, 2020, convening at 9:00 a.m. via teleconference, pursuant to Governor Gavin Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 and the California Shelter-in-Place mandate. President Simon presided; Patricia K. Williams, District Secretary.

Directors Present: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon.

Absent: None.

President Simon acknowledged the passing of Oakland Fire Department Assistant Fire Chief Sean Laffan and requested the Chief of Police Ed Alvarez give remarks regarding Assistant Fire Chief Laffan.

President Simon gave instructions on viewing the Meeting and accessing presentation materials online, the virtual meeting, Public Comment, and Board Members' remarks.

President Simon brought Item 2-A, Report from the Personnel Review Special Committee Meeting of November 12, 2020, before the Board, and announced that there was no announcement to be made.

Consent Calendar action items brought before the Board were:

1. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of October 22, 2020.
2. Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) Replacement Funding Exchange and Reserve Account Withdrawal for Expansion Rail Cars Procurement.
3. Award of Contract No. 20LZ-130A, Train Control Room Battery Replacement, Phase 3.
4. Appointment to BART Safety, Reliability and Traffic Relief Program (Measure RR) Bond Oversight Committee (BOC).
5. Funding Agreement with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission for the Development of a Travel Demand Model for the New Transbay Rail Crossing Program.

Director Dufty requested that Item 3-C, Award of Contract No. 20LZ-130A, Train Control Room Battery Replacement, Phase 3, be removed from the Consent Calendar.

Director Saltzman made the following motions as a unit. Director McPartland seconded the motions, which carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

1. That the Minutes of the Meeting of October 22, 2020, be approved.
2. That the Board formally approves the withdrawal of \$161 million from the BART Car Replacement Funding Exchange and Reserve Account to fund the purchase of railcars under the Transbay Corridor Core Capacity Project.
3. That the BART Board appoint Ms. Sonja C. Stewart of Oakland to fill the vacant Project Management Institute seat for the remainder of the current term, which ends on June 30, 2021.
4. That the General Manager or his designee be authorized to execute an agreement with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) to provide funding not to exceed \$200,000.00 for MTC staff and consultant costs to develop a travel demand model needed for the New Transbay Rail Crossing program.

President Simon called for Public Comment on the Consent Calendar. No comments were received.

Tamar Allen, Assistant General Manager, Operations, presented Item 3-C, Award of Contract No. 20LZ-130A, Train Control Room Battery Replacement, Phase 3.

John Arantes addressed the Board.

Director Allen moved that the General Manager be authorized to award Contract No. 20LZ-130A for Train Control Room Battery Replacement to Rosendin Electric, Inc. for an amount of \$4,642,815.00, pursuant to a notification to be issued by the General Manager, subject to compliance with the District's Protest Procedure and Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) requirements related to protests.

Director Dufty made a substitute motion to continue Item 3-C, Award of Contract No. 20LZ-130A, Train Control Room Battery Replacement, Phase 3, to the December 3, 2020 Board Meeting. Director Saltzman seconded the substitute motion.

The item was discussed and continued to a future meeting.

President Simon gave an overview of the next several agenda items and announced that the order of agenda items would be changed.

President Simon called for general Public Comment. Aleta Dupree and George Cleveland addressed the Board.

President Simon brought the matter of Independent Police Auditor Quarterly Update before the Board. Russell Bloom, Independent Police Auditor (IPA), presented the item.

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Raburn thanked IPA Bloom for his work and commented on IPA Bloom's collaboration with the BART Chief of Police.

Director Li thanked staff for their participation in the Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE) training series and IPA Bloom for his presentation and work.

Director Allen thanked IPA Bloom for his work and new ideas; inquired about the existence of a law requiring passengers to wear face masks in transit, a directive regarding BART Police Officers' enforcement of the face mask requirement, BART Police Department (BPD) enforcement contacts, and requests for proof of payment; and commented on face mask enforcement.

Director Saltzman thanked IPA Bloom, staff, and Chief Alvarez for their work and thanked Chief Alvarez for his collaboration with IPA Bloom.

Director Foley thanked IPA Bloom for his leadership in the Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) and inquired when the Racial Equity Action Plan would be presented to the Board.

Director Ames thanked IPA Bloom and staff for working with the BPD and inquired about identification of successful de-escalation efforts.

General Manager Powers thanked and recognized IPA Bloom for his work.

President Simon echoed the sentiment of the Board Members and thanked IPA Bloom for his work.

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

President Simon brought the matter of Quarterly Report of the Controller/Treasurer for the Period Ending June 30, 2020 before the Board. Rosemarie Poblete, Controller/Treasurer, and Christopher Gan, Assistant Controller, presented the item.

President Simon announced that the Controller/Treasurer's Report would be continued later in the Meeting.

Director Saltzman, Chairperson of the Planning, Public Affairs, Access, and Legislation Committee, brought the matter of Exclusive Negotiating Agreement for Transit-Oriented Development with Holliday Development and The Related Companies of California, a joint venture, at the El Cerrito Plaza BART Station before the Board. Shannon Dodge, Principal Property Development Officer, Real Estate and Property Development, presented the item.

Director Saltzman thanked El Cerrito Mayor Greg Lyman for his service.

The following individuals addressed the Board:

Mayor Lyman  
El Cerrito Mayor Pro Tem Paul Fadelli  
Fei Tsen  
Jacob Adiarte  
Felix AuYeung  
Ann Silverberg

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Saltzman commented on the outreach for and feedback on the project, the selection team and recommendation for the project, partnerships with cities, support for staff's recommendation, and working with the selected team to determine project details.

President Simon commented on feedback from the public and support for the project.

Director Ames expressed support for the project; recognized Windflower for their work on the Union City Station project; and inquired about the inclusion of workforce housing in the project and mitigating the potential negative fiscal impact of the project on the City of El Cerrito.

Director Raburn thanked Mayor Lyman and Mayor Pro Tem Fadelli for their participation in the Meeting and support for the project; and commented on the firms, housing at the Coliseum Connections project, modular construction, the selection team's decision, and utilizing a density bonus to help fund projects.

Director Li commented on Propositions 209 and 16 and the educator housing project in San Francisco; thanked the selection team for its work and Mayor Lyman and Mayor Pro Tem Fadelli for speaking at the Meeting; expressed appreciation for the work of Director Saltzman and President Simon; and commented on the Windflower/Mid Pen Housing team's proposal, the selection team's decision, support for the selection team's work and the proposed action; and requested that the Holliday/Related/Satellite Affordable Housing Associates (SAHA) team increase its affordability percentage and small business commitments.

Director Dufty thanked staff, Abigail Thorne-Lyman, Group Manager, Transit-Oriented Development, Systems Development; Val Menotti, Chief Planning and Development Officer, Systems Development; and Principal Property Development Officer Dodge for their work; inquired about the recommendation for Windflower; associated himself with Director Li's comments regarding the failure of Proposition 16; and commented on negotiating with the winning team regarding increased small business and affordability efforts, Windflower's identification of missing middle housing as an important group; thanked Fei Tsen; inquired about the length of the negotiating period and possible extension; and thanked Director Saltzman for her leadership.

Director Foley expressed support for staff's recommendation; thanked Director Saltzman for her leadership and Mayor Lyman and the El Cerrito City Council for their work; and commented on identifying a solution that minimizes the impact of the parking shift on neighborhoods and encourages the addition and frequency of bus routes.

Director Allen commended staff on the success of the selection process and commented on support for the selection team process; delaying work on the project and new transit-oriented development projects (TOD) until the transit budget and operations are stable; and opposition to the project.

Director McPartland thanked staff for their work and commented on the opportunity to support the community and Director Saltzman in partnership with the City of El Cerrito, TOD, and supporting jobs; and inquired about project labor agreements.

Director McPartland moved that in the event that Holliday Development/SAHA cannot fulfill the requirements necessary that remaining responses to the Request for Qualifications be reevaluated.

The motion brought by Director McPartland died for lack of a second.

Director Saltzman moved that the General Manager or his designee be authorized to enter into an exclusive negotiating agreement (ENA) with a joint venture comprised of Holliday Development and The Related Companies of California for a term of 24 months, with an additional 12 month extension option; and that if BART and Holliday/Related cannot in good faith negotiate an ENA, or if the ENA terminates by its own terms or due to mutual agreement of the parties, the Board authorizes the General Manager or his designee to enter into an ENA with Windflower and MidPen Housing, or an entity comprised of both, for a term of up to 24 months, with an additional 12 month extension option. President Simon seconded the motion, which carried by roll call vote. Ayes: 8 – Directors Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 1 – Director Allen.

Director Saltzman brought the matter of Single Source Procurement with eLock Technologies, LLC for Electronic Bicycle Lockers before the Board.

Director Raburn moved that the Board finds, by two-thirds majority vote, pursuant to Public Contract Code Section 20227, that eLock Technologies is the single source of procurement for 23 additional electronic bicycle locker quads; and that the General Manager be authorized to purchase the lockers for an amount not to exceed \$348,203.10. Director Li seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous roll call vote by the required two-thirds vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

Director Saltzman brought the matter of Extension of the Exclusive Negotiating Agreement for Transit-Oriented Development with LMTOD, LLC and East Bay Asian Local Development Corporation, for the Lake Merritt BART Station Project, before the Board. Transit-Oriented Development Group Manager Thorne-Lyman presented the item.

Director Raburn commented on the impact of the pandemic on East Bay Asian Local Development Corporation's (EBALDC) proposal; requested that staff provide the access plan referred to in the Executive Decision Document; and expressed support for the extension.

Director Raburn moved that the General Manager or his designee be authorized to extend BART's current Exclusive Negotiating Agreement (ENA) with East Bay Asian Local Development Corporation (EBALDC) and LMTOD, LLC for a term of 12 months, with an additional 6-month extension option. Director Li seconded the motion.

Director Ames inquired about relocation of the BPD and Operations Control Center and approvals from the City of Oakland regarding the project; and requested that staff provide information regarding the public safety facility, including cost.

Ener Chiu addressed the Board.

The motion brought by Director Raburn and seconded by Director Li carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

Director Saltzman brought the matter of Update on BART Headquarters Office Building (2150 Webster St., Oakland, CA) before the Board. Carl Holmes, Assistant General Manager, Design and Construction, and Maceo Wiggins, Director of the Office of Civil Rights, presented the item.

Director McPartland commented on his previous inquiry regarding social distancing at the dais in the new Board Room.

Director Saltzman commented on returning to in-person Board Meetings and suggested that discussion of returning to in-person Board Meetings should be added to a future Board Meeting agenda.

Director Raburn recognized the efforts of Directors Dufty and Simon to ensure the contract has substantial support for the community with the Small Business Program and commended Office of Civil Rights Director Wiggins for his work.

President Simon called for Board Members' questions or comments regarding Item 6-A, Quarterly Report of the Controller/Treasurer for the Period Ending June 30, 2020. No questions or comments were received.

President Simon thanked Controller/Treasurer Pobleto for her report and work.

Director McPartland, Chairperson of the Administration Committee, brought the matter of Award of Agreement No. 6M2076, Non-Competitive and Non-Federal Procurement with Giesecke & Devrient America, Inc., for On-Call Maintenance Services Agreement on Currency Machines, before the Board.

Director Li moved that the General Manager or his designee be authorized to execute a 5-year service agreement (Calendar Year 2021 – Calendar Year 2025) not to exceed \$614,631.00 with Giesecke & Devrient America, for on-call maintenance services for the Currency Machine System (CMS). Director Saltzman seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

Director McPartland brought the matter of Fiscal Year 2021 Budget and Service Plan Update before the Board. Christopher Simi, Director of Budgets; Assistant General Manager Allen; Office of Civil Rights Director Wiggins; and Pamela Herhold, Assistant General Manager, Performance and Budget, presented the item.

Director McPartland expressed appreciation for staff and Director Simi's indication that the last priority will be layoffs.

Patricia Williams, District Secretary, noted that a written comment from Clarence Fischer would be e-mailed to the Board and read excerpts from the comment into the record.

Buddy Roark addressed the Board.

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Raburn commented on augmenting reserves in the past year, BART's early response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the seven-point plan, and support for service plan B.

Director Ames inquired about when station closures would be presented to the Board and increasing ridership by eliminating the fare increase and parking fees; requested more budget detail before finalizing union contracts; and expressed appreciation for staff's creation of the retirement program.

Director McPartland inquired about the flexibility of service planning.

Director Allen commented on the reduction of positions associated with Service Scenario A, Current Service; inquired about the current overall projected budget deficit, the \$33 million projected budget deficit and the \$12 million reserve; expressed agreement with Director Ames regarding execution of union contracts; and commented on reducing budgeted expenses.

Director Li commented on full-time BART employees, her commitment to retaining employees and keeping the system running, not pursuing scenarios C or D, the inability to resolve the budget deficit with reductions, and her commitment to advocate for federal funding; and thanked staff for their efforts to increase efficiencies and decrease non-labor expenses and General Manager Powers for working with union leadership and sharing information as it is received.

Director Dufty associated himself with Director Li's comments regarding the importance of BART employees; commented on management staff's collaboration with unions, transit recovery funding, and appreciation for staff's creativity around retirement incentives; and commended the \$12 million yielded from efficiencies in the first quarter.

Director Saltzman associated herself with the comments from Directors Li and Dufty and thanked staff for their work.

Director Foley associated himself with the comments from Directors Li, Dufty, and Saltzman and commented on working with partners to find a creative solution, federal support and self-sufficiency, the District's Retirement Incentive Program, disagreement with comments regarding not engaging in negotiations and bargaining, and identifying long-term sustainable solutions that bring financial stability to BART and every transit agency in the United States.

President Simon thanked staff for their work and commented on support for service scenario B and meeting the goal to decrease the budget deficit, lobbying for resources, making hard choices based on values, and making sure that transit-dependent people and those who chose to use transit have BART as an option.

Director McPartland brought the matter of District Retirement Incentive Program before the Board. Veronica Thomas, Director of Human Resources, Talent Acquisition, presented the item.

Director Dufty expressed support for the Program.

Director Li expressed support for the Program.

Director Raburn expressed support for the Program and commented on and/or inquired about the number of employees expected to participate in the Program and eligibility for the Program.

President Simon moved that the General Manager be authorized to establish a District Retirement Incentive Program in Fiscal Year 2021 (FY21) and to take any actions which may be necessary to implement this program, including amending the Money Purchase Pension Plan and the Deferred Compensation Plan. Director Saltzman seconded the motion.

Discussion continued, with the following highlights:

Director Allen commented on Fiscal Year 2022 (FY 22) salary and benefits savings, the structure of the Program, and opposition to the Program.

Director Saltzman expressed support for the Program.

Director Ames expressed appreciation for Director Allen's comments; requested that the Inspector General conduct a span of control audit to evaluate departments' efficiency; and expressed support for the Program.

Vice President Foley expressed support for staff's recommendation.

Director McPartland expressed support for staff's recommendation.

The motion brought by President Simon and seconded by Director Saltzman carried by roll call vote. Ayes: 8 – Directors Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 1 – Director Allen.

Director McPartland brought the matter of Actuarial Report on Changes to Other Postemployment Benefits (OPEB) under Consideration by the District before the Board. Shana Dines, Director of Labor Relations, presented the item.

President Simon announced that the Board would enter closed session under Items 9-A (Conference with Legal Counsel – Pending Litigation) and 9-B (Conference with Legal Counsel: Anticipated Litigation) of the Regular Meeting agenda, and that the Board would reconvene in open session upon conclusion of the closed session.



The Board Meeting recessed at 12:48 p.m.

---

---

The Board reconvened in closed session at 1:02 p.m.

Directors present: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon.

Absent: None.

The Board Meeting recessed at 1:25 p.m.

---

---

The Board reconvened in open session at 1:31 p.m.

Directors present: Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon.

Absent: None.

President Simon announced that the Board had concluded its closed session and there were no announcements to be made.

President Simon brought Item 12-A, Resolution in Support of the Seamless Transit Principles, before the Board. Director Saltzman presented the item.

Director Saltzman moved that Resolution No. 5459, In the Matter of Seamless Transit Principles, be adopted. Director Li seconded the motion.

Joe Kunzler and Jordan Wing addressed the Board.

Director Li commented on Assembly Bill 2057, introduced by Assemblymember David Chiu, and expressed support for the Resolution.

The following individuals addressed the Board:

Stephanie Beechum  
Tapik Badan  
Sam Deutsch  
Aleta Dupree

The motion brought by Director Saltzman and seconded by Director Li carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

Director Dufty, Chairperson of the Engineering and Operations Committee, brought the following matters before the Board: (1) Sole Source Procurement with Simmons Machine Tool Corporation for the Purchase of Dual Wheel Truing Machine; (2) Change Orders to Contract No. 07EA-120, 19th St./Oakland Station Modernization Project, with Proven Management, Inc., for Replacement Lighting System; (3) Change Order to Contract No. 09AU-120, BART Earthquake Safety Program Transbay Tube (TBT) Internal Retrofit, with Shimmick/CEC, Joint Venture, for Installation of Temporary Generators (C.O. No. 187); and (4) Change Orders to Contract No. 15EJ-171, 34.5 kV Cable Replacement M-Line MVS Switching Station and MTF, MSS, MPS, and MTW Substations, with DMZ Builders – (i) Construction of Security Enclosures for New Isolation Disconnect Switches (IDS's) (C.O. No. 12) and (ii) Construction of Sequencing Modifications (C.O. No. 25).

Director Li made the following motions as a unit. Director Foley seconded the motions, which carried by unanimous roll call vote. Ayes: 9 – Directors Allen, Ames, Dufty, Foley, Li, McPartland, Raburn, Saltzman, and Simon. Noes: 0.

1. That pursuant to California Public Contract Code Section 20227, the Board of Directors finds that Simmons Machine Tool Corporation is the sole source for the procurement of a Dual Wheel Truing Machine for the BART Concord Yard Facility and that the purchase is for the sole purpose of replacing or duplicating equipment in use; and that the Board of Directors authorizes the General Manager to execute a Contract with Simmons Machine Tool Corporation for the procurement of the Dual Wheel Truing Machine, in an amount not to exceed \$3,900,000.00. (Carried by the required two-thirds vote.)
2. That the General Manager be authorized to execute Change Orders, in an aggregate amount not to exceed \$550,000.00 to Contract No. 07EA-120, 19th St/Oakland Station Modernization with ProVen Management to provide a replacement lighting system.
3. That the General Manager be authorized to execute Change Order No. 187, Installation of Temporary Generators, to Contract No. 09AU-120, BART Earthquake Safety Program TBT Internal Retrofit with Shimmick/CEC Joint Venture in an amount not to exceed \$1,500,000.00.
4. That the General Manager be authorized to execute Change Order Nos. 012 and 025 in an aggregate amount not to exceed \$850,000.00 to Contract No. 15EJ-171, 34.5KV Cable Replacement M-Line MVS Switching Station and MTF, MSS, MPS and MTW Substations.

Director Dufty brought the matter of Overview of the Transit Security Advisory Committee before the Board. Armando Sandoval, Community Outreach Specialist, Police Operations Division, presented the item.

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

Director Dufty commented on the Transit Security Advisory Committee's (TSAC) vacancies.

Director Dufty brought the matter of Quarterly Service Performance Review – First Quarter Fiscal Year 2021 before the Board. Assistant General Manager Allen and Chief Alvarez presented the item.

Director Saltzman exited the Meeting.

The item was discussed, with the following highlights:

Director Dufty inquired about BART Police presence in and around parking facilities in the early morning and commented on Chief Alvarez reviewing data and focusing police efforts on parking lots.

Director Li commented on and/or inquired about the Quarterly Service Performance Review (QPR) – First Quart Fiscal Year 2021 data, categorization of crimes against persons, conflation of crimes, and staff continuing to report the types of crimes that occur; and requested that the QPR graphs include crime types.

Director McPartland inquired about increasing BPD staff when ridership increases and increasing Public Service Announcements (PSA) regarding phone thefts.

Director Raburn commented on the data regarding transients, the benefit of a Homeless Outreach Team (HOT) for Alameda County, additional staff in the BPD, Measure W, reaching out to Alameda County Supervisor Nate Miley to develop a partnership to address homelessness, and Board Members asking county supervisors for support regarding homelessness.

Director Ames thanked Director Raburn for his suggestion to seek support from county supervisors; inquired about fixed post station deployments in the morning; commented on lighting in the parking lots at the South Hayward, Union City, and Fremont stations; and requested that staff conduct a survey of lighting in parking lots.

Director Ames exited the Meeting.

Director Foley highlighted Director Li’s comment regarding additional QPR data details; commented on a carjacking incident in San Leandro, his previous request for a follow-up report after a fatal incident on a train last year, the importance of understanding an incident, the cause of the incident, and opportunities for improvement, and understanding whether patrolling efforts should be increased in parking lots between 5:00 a.m. and 7:00 a. m. and 5:00 p.m. and 7:00 p.m.; and requested that staff provide the Board with more detail about specific incidents and information about how policing is changed to better protect riders.

President Simon called for the General Manager’s report. General Manager Powers reported on BART’s participation in the California Transit Association (CTA) annual conference, the \$60 million funding award from the Solutions for Congested Corridors Program (SCCP), the grant award from the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) for slope stabilization and erosion control, Clipper® card utilization, and Clipper® START<sup>SM</sup>.

Aleta Dupree addressed the Board.

President Simon called for Board Member Reports, Roll Call for Introductions, and In Memoriam requests.

President Simon requested that the Meeting be adjourned in honor of Oakland Fire Department (OFD) Assistant Chief Sean Laffan; gave remarks regarding Assistant Chief Laffan; and expressed condolences to OFD Chief Melinda Drayton, OFD, the first responder community, and Assistant Chief Laffan's family.

Director McPartland gave remarks regarding Assistant Chief Laffan.

Chief Alvarez gave remarks regarding Assistant Chief Laffan.

Director Dufty expressed appreciation to Rodd Lee, Assistant General Manager, External Affairs, and Be the Change Consulting for their work and requested that the Meeting be adjourned in honor of Barbara Taylor, local political reporter and journalist.

Director Li echoed Director Dufty's appreciation for staff.

Director Allen exited the Meeting.

Director Raburn reported that he had given a presentation to the Kiwanis Club of Alameda; toured the new component repair shop and central warehouse at the Hayward Maintenance Complex; worked with Alameda County Supervisor Nate Miley to provide access to a polling center; attended the Bay Area Council's "Race to a Vaccine" meeting; and participated in the Capitol Corridor Joint Powers Authority Board meeting.

Director Foley reported that he had attended the BART policing public safety discussion in his district; thanked Assistant General Manager Lee's staff and Ariel Mercado, Principal Government and Community Relations Representative, for their work; reported that he had attended the City of Brentwood's Innovation Center Town Hall meeting; requested that staff provide an update on fare gates to the Board; and expressed gratitude for Assistant Chief Laffan's dedication to public service.

The Meeting adjourned at 2:49 p.m. in honor of Barbara Taylor and Oakland Fire Department Assistant Chief Sean Laffan.

Patricia K. Williams  
District Secretary