

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

BART Police Citizen Review Board  
Monday, November 13, 2017

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held on Monday, November 13, 2017 convening at 4:00 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 344 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chairperson William White, Kenneth Loo, Cathryn Freitas, Darren White, Bob Maginnis, Cydia Garrett, Les Mensinger, Aman Sebahtu, David Rizk, and Richard Knowles.

BART Staff: BART Police Department (BPD) Deputy Chief Jeffrey Jennings, BPD Deputy Chief Lance Haight, BPD Officer Shane Reiss, Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom, and Independent Police Investigator Patrick Caceres.

Others Present: BART Director John McPartland, BART Director Robert Raburn

Agenda items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:08 p.m. by Chairperson George Perezvelez.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**  
Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chairperson William White, Kenneth Loo, Cathryn Freitas, Darren White, Bob Maginnis, Cydia Garrett, Les Mensinger, Aman Sebahtu, and Richard Knowles were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting and Special Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
A motion to approve the minutes for the Prior Board Meeting and Special Meeting was made by Mr. Maginnis and seconded by Mr. D. White. The motion passed with nine in favor, zero against, and one abstention.
- 5. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 minutes per speaker. (An opportunity for members of the public to address the BPCRB on matters under their jurisdiction and not on the agenda.)**  
No general discussion. No public comment.

**6. Review National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) 2017 Annual Conference Report-Back from Attendees. For Discussion and Action.**

Chairperson Perezvelez, Mr. Mensinger, Mr. Bloom, and Mr. Caceres recounted their experiences attending the NACOLE 23<sup>rd</sup> Annual Conference in Spokane, Washington from September 10, 2017 – September 14, 2017.

**7. Review of 2017 Quarter 3 BPCRB Report to the BART Board of Directors. For discussion and action.**

A motion to approve the 2017 Quarter 3 BPCRB Report to the BART Board of Directors, with the additions from BPCRB Members, was made by Mr. D. White and seconded by Mr. Loo. The motion passed unanimously.

**8. Training and Community Outreach Planning. For discussion and Action.**

The BPCRB discussed this item.

Mr. Bloom addressed the BPCRB.

The item will be agendaized for a future meeting for further discussion.

Mr. Rizk entered the meeting at 4:34 p.m.

No action taken.

**9. Memo to the BART Board of Directors Regarding OIR Oversight System Evaluation Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Chairperson Perezvelez discussed this item. He asked the BPCRB to review the memo and OIR Report recommendations spreadsheet and provide their thoughts and feedback at next month's BPCRB meeting. This item will be put on December's meeting agenda for further discussion and action.

No action taken.

**10. Chief of Police's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Deputy Chief Lance Haight represented Chief Carlos Rojas, who was out of town attending a Chiefs of Police Conference in Bodega Bay, California.

**a. BPD Monthly Reports for August and September.**

BPD Monthly Reports for August and September 2017 were distributed to the BPCRB and Deputy Chief Haight answered questions from the BPCRB.

**11. Independent Police Auditor's report. For Discussion and Action.**

**a. OIPA Monthly Reports for September and October**

Mr. Bloom distributed OIPA Monthly Reports for September and October 2017.

**b. OIPA Annual Report**

Mr. Bloom presented a draft of the OIPA Biannual Report for Fiscal Years 2016 and 2017. He invited the BPCRB to share their comments and suggestions on the report before finalizing the report.

Ms. Freitas exited the meeting at 5:40 p.m.

**12. Closed Session.**

**a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in OIPA Case #17-09. Govt. Code Section 54957.**

A motion to extend the meeting to 6:10 p.m. was made by Mr. Knowles and seconded by Mr. D. White. The motion passed unanimously.

The BPCRB reconvened in open session at 6:08 p.m., and Chairperson Perezvelez announced the votes taken during the closed session with regards to agenda item #12a. The BPCRB voted to accept the findings reached by OIPA with eight votes in favor, one against and one abstention.

**13. Adjournment.**

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Mr. Knowles and was seconded by Mr. Maginnis. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:08 p.m.