

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART Police Citizen Review Board Meeting Minutes**  
**Monday, April 8, 2019**

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held April 8, 2019 convening at 4:10 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 2040 Webster Street, Oakland, California. The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson William White; May Cooper, Recording Secretary.

Members Present: Members Christina Gomez, Kenneth Loo, Erin Armstrong, Les Mensinger, Richard Knowles and William White.

Absent: Chairperson George Perezvelez, Pete Longmire and Darren White.  
David Rizk entered the meeting later.

**1. Call to Order.**

The regular meeting was called to order at 4:10 p.m. by Vice Chairperson White.

Vice Chairperson William White, Christina Gomez, Kenneth Loo, Les Mensinger, Erin Armstrong, and Richard Knowles were present, amounting to a quorum.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

Vice Chairperson White announced the departure of Member Richard Knowles from the BPCRB. Mr. Mensinger thanked Mr. Knowles for his service on the BPCRB.

**2. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of March 11, 2019.**

Mr. Mensinger moved that the Minutes of the Meeting of March 11, 2019 be approved; Ms. Armstrong seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote. Ayes – 6: Members W. White, Loo, Gomez, Mensinger, Armstrong and Knowles. Noes - 0. Absent - 4: Members Perezvelez, D. White, Longmire and Rizk.

**3. BART Progressive Discipline Rules/Procedures Training.**

Police Lieutenant VI Kevin Franklin gave a presentation on the BART Police Progressive Discipline Model. The item was discussed.

Mr. Rizk joined the meeting.

**4. Chief of Police's Report.**

**BART Police Department (BPD) Monthly Report for February 2019.**

Chief Carlos Rojas announced his retirement from the District. Members thanked Chief Rojas for his service.

Deputy Chief Lance Haight presented the BPD Monthly Report and announced BPD's partnership with the District's Operations Department to assist with fare evasion initiatives in downtown San Francisco. The item was discussed.

**5. Update on Ad Hoc Subcommittee to Review of BPD Policy# 310, Officer Involved Shootings and Deaths.**

Mr. Rizk shared that the subcommittee came to a consensus on recommendations to BPD Policy# 310, Officer Involved Shootings and Deaths, and that the recommendations were submitted to BPD for review.

Mr. Rizk exited the meeting.

**6. Approval of Quarterly Reports to the Board of Directors.**

Vice Chairperson White brought the matter of the Quarterly Reports to the BART Board of Directors from July through September 2018 (Quarter 3) and October through December 2018 (Quarter 4) before the Board. The item was discussed.

Mr. Loo requested a correction to the Community Outreach and Other Activities section of the report for Quarter 4, to include his attendance at BPD's "Trunk or Treat" event. The correction was accepted. Mr. Mensinger moved that the Board approve both reports, with the addition of Mr. Loo's correction. Mr. Loo seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote. Ayes – 6: Members W. White, Loo, Gomez, Mensinger, Armstrong and Knowles. Noes - 0. Absent - 4: Members Perezvelez, D. White, Longmire and Rizk.

Mr. Rizk rejoined the meeting.

**7. Independent Police Auditor's Report.  
Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Monthly Report for March 2019.**

Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom presented the OIPA Monthly Report. The report was discussed.

Patrick Caceres, Independent Police Investigator, updated the Board on the upcoming 2019 National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) Training and Networking Series.

**8. Public Comment.**

No comments were received.

Mr. Mensinger requested on behalf of the entire Board that the Meeting be adjourned in honor of Fremont Fire Chief, Daniel T. Lydon.

Vice Chairperson White announced that the Board would enter closed session under Item 9-A (Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in OIPA Case #18-38) of the regular meeting agenda, and that the Board would reconvene in open session at the conclusion of the closed session.

The Meeting recessed at 5:07 p.m.

---

---

The Meeting reconvened in Closed Session at 5:13 p.m.

**9. Closed Session.**

- a. To reconsider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in OIPA Case #18-38. Govt. Code §54957.

Board Members present: Members W. White, Armstrong, Knowles, Mensinger, Gomez, Loo and Rizk.

**10. Open Session.**

The Meeting reconvened in Open Session at 5:20 p.m.

Board Members present: Members W. White, Armstrong, Knowles, Mensinger, Gomez, Loo and Rizk.

Vice Chairperson White announced that the Board had concluded its closed session, and that the Board voted unanimously to accept the findings in OIPA Case #18-38.

The Meeting was adjourned at 5:21 p.m. in honor of Daniel T. Lydon.